CITY OF WEST LAFAYETTE
COMMON COUNCIL
MINUTES
OCTOBER 3, 2016

The Common Council of the City of West Lafayette, Indiana, met in the Multi-Purpose Room at the Morton Community Center on October 3, 2016, at the hour of 6:30 p.m.

President Bunder called the meeting to order and presided.

The Pledge of Allegiance was repeated.

Present: Peter Bunder, Nick DeBoer, Steve Dietrich, Aseem Jha, Gerry Keen, Larry Leverenz, Gerald Thomas, and Norris Wang.

Absent: David Sanders

Also present: Mayor John Dennis, Corporation Counsel Eric Burns, Clerk Sana Booker, IT Director Brad Alexander, Director of Development Erik Carlson, Police Chief Jason Dombkowski, Parks Superintendent Janet Fawley, Human Resources Director Diane Foster, City Engineer Ed Garrison, City Controller Peter Gray, Deputy Police Chief Troy Harris, Fire Chief Tim Heath, WWTU Director David Henderson, and Street Commissioner Doug Payne.

MINUTES
Councilor Keen moved for acceptance of the minutes of the September 1, 2016, Pre-Council Meeting, the September 6, 2016, Common Council Meeting, and the September 20, 2016, Special Common Council Meeting. Councilor DeBoer seconded the motion, and the motion passed by voice vote.

President Bunder noted that the spelling of Councilor Jha's name has been corrected.

REPORTS OF CITY DEPARTMENTS ON FILE IN THE CLERK'S OFFICE
There were no comments.

REPORT OF THE APC REPRESENTATIVES
There was no report.

PUBLIC RELATIONS:
Beautification Award
Councilor Jha presented the Beautification Award to Elizabeth Shiffman, a resident of Westminster Village. He described how Ms. Shiffman completely transformed the original garden behind Building B at Westminster Village.

Ms. Shiffman spoke about the garden, describing the many types of plants there and some of the changes she made to it from the original design. She wanted the garden to be relevant to the people who live at Westminster, so the garden now includes plants that the residents used when they were living in their houses. She spoke of how people from the health care center frequently come to visit the garden, and she hopes that it brings back memories and stimulates their minds. She expressed her appreciation for the award.

Council Appointment: Go Greener Commission
President Bunder stated that Clayton Nevins has been put forward to join the Go Greener Commission. Mr. Nevins is a Soil Management PhD student and works with the Purdue Graduate Student Government.

Councilor DeBoer moved to appoint Clayton Nevins to the Go Greener Commission. Councilor Dietrich seconded the motion, and the motion passed by voice vote.

FINANCIAL REPORT
City Controller Gray stated that the report is on file. We are running about 76% of our budget at three-quarters of the way through the year, so we are right in line with our expenditures.

LEGAL REPORT
Corporation Counsel Burns stated that this report is on file.

SPECIAL REPORTS:
Joint Board Report
Councilor DeBoer reported that the quarterly Joint Board meeting is scheduled for October 18, 2016.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS:
Ordinance No. 26-16 An Ordinance Providing For Temporary Loans (Parks) (Submitted by the Controller)

Councilor Keen read Ordinance No. 26-16 by title only, and he moved for its passage on second and final reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor DeBoer.

Controller Gray stated that this temporary loan is to make sure that we have Parks Department expenses covered before we get the tax levy in from the County.

There was no further discussion.

Clerk Booker called the roll call vote:

Councilperson	**Vote**
Bunder	Aye
DeBoer	Aye
Dietrich	Aye
Jha	Aye
Keen	Aye
Leverenz	Aye
Sanders	Absent
Thomas	Aye
Wang	Aye

Clerk Booker stated that the vote was 8 AYES and 0 NAYS.

President Bunder announced that Ordinance No. 26-16 passed on second and final reading.

Ordinance No. 27-16 An Ordinance Setting The 2017 City Budget And Setting The 2017 Tax Levy On Property And Tax Rate (Submitted by the Controller)

Councilor Keen read Ordinance No. 27-16 by title only, and he moved for its passage on second and final reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor DeBoer.

Controller Gray stated that this is the budget we are proposing to the State. From the original reading we did have a change brought up at the public hearing about reducing the CCD budget down to $560,890 to match funds that were coming in. He confirmed for Corporation Counsel Burns that he is requesting the amendment as outlined in the proposed amendment available on the agenda.

Councilor Dietrich moved to amend Ordinance No. 27-16. Councilor DeBoer seconded the motion, and the motion passed by voice vote.

President Bunder stated that looking ahead to the 2018 budget, we are looking into finding revenue enhancements with the fee structure and perhaps the creation of a recreational revenue enhancements. Controller Gray stated that there are a number of different options that are out there, and that this is one that has been discussed. We need to do a study to find whether or not it is appropriate for us, and there are other ways to increase revenue that we are looking at, other than just taxes.

Councilor DeBoer asked if there is really a difference between revenue and taxes when it comes to the City anyway. Councilor Dietrich stated that we can raise revenue, but we cannot raise taxes. Controller Gray stated that there are a number of revenue streams, the County taxes being one of them. Councilor DeBoer stated that if the government levies money from somebody he will consider it a tax, intellectually, one way or the other.

President Bunder stated that a wheel tax and fees, which have not been raised since 1992, are the sorts of things we will be looking at. Controller Gray stated that the County has had a wheel tax for a number of years, and it is an avenue we can research if it seems appropriate.

There was no further discussion.

Clerk Booker called the roll call vote:

Councilperson	**Vote**
Bunder	Aye
DeBoer	Aye
Dietrich	Aye
Jha	Aye
Keen	Aye
Leverenz	Aye
Sanders	Absent
Thomas	Aye
Wang	Aye

Clerk Booker stated that the vote was 8 AYES and 0 NAYS.

President Bunder announced that Ordinance No. 27-16 (Amended) passed on second and final reading.

Ordinance No. 28-16 An Ordinance To Fix The Salaries Of Appointed Officers, Employees, And Members Of The Police And Fire Departments Of The City Of West Lafayette, Indiana, For The Year 2017. (Sponsored by Mayor John Dennis)

Councilor Keen read Ordinance No. 28-16 by title only, and he moved for its passage on second and final reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor DeBoer.

Controller Gray stated that the salary ordinance reflects a 3% cost-of-living increase in the salary ranges.

There was no further discussion.

Clerk Booker called the roll call vote:

Councilperson	Vote
Bunder	Aye
DeBoer	Aye
Dietrich	Aye
Jha	Aye
Keen	Aye
Leverenz	Aye
Sanders	Absent
Thomas	Aye
Wang	Aye

Clerk Booker stated that the vote was 8 AYES and 0 NAYS.

President Bunder announced that Ordinance No. 28-16 passed on second and final reading.

Ordinance No. 29-16 An Ordinance To Fix The 2017 Wastewater Treatment Utility Salary Schedule As Submitted By The Board Of Public Works And Safety For Approval By The Common Council Of The City Of West Lafayette, Indiana (Presented by the Board of Public Works and Safety)

Councilor Keen read Ordinance No. 29-16 by title only, and he moved for its passage on second and final reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor DeBoer.

Controller Gray stated that this ordinance also reflects the 3% increase.

There was no further discussion.

Clerk Booker called the roll call vote:

Councilperson	Vote
Bunder	Aye
DeBoer	Aye
Dietrich	Aye
Jha	Aye
Keen	Aye

Councilperson	Vote
Leverenz	Aye
Sanders	Absent
Thomas	Aye
Wang	Aye

Clerk Booker stated that the vote was 8 AYES and 0 NAYS.

President Bunder announced that Ordinance No. 29-16 passed on second and final reading.

Ordinance No. 30-16 An Ordinance To Set The Salaries Of The Elected Officials, City Of West Lafayette, Indiana, For The Year 2017 (Submitted by the Controller)

Councilor Keen read Ordinance No. 30-16 by title only, and he moved for its passage on second and final reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor DeBoer.

Controller Gray stated that this ordinance also reflects the 3% increase.

There was no further discussion.

Clerk Booker called the roll call vote:

Councilperson	Vote
Bunder	Aye
DeBoer	Aye
Dietrich	Aye
Jha	Aye
Keen	Aye
Leverenz	Aye
Sanders	Absent
Thomas	Aye
Wang	Aye

Clerk Booker stated that the vote was 8 AYES and 0 NAYS.

President Bunder announced that Ordinance No. 30-16 passed on second and final reading.

NEW BUSINESS:
Ordinance No. 31-16 To Amend Certain Portions Of The Unified Zoning Ordinance Of Tippecanoe County, Indiana, Designating The Time When The Same Shall Take Effect. (Core-Up Master JV, LLC) (The Hub at West Lafayette PD) (R3W to PDMX) (Submitted by Area Plan Commission)

Councilor Keen read Ordinance No. 31-16 by title only, and he moved for its passage first and only reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor DeBoer.

Dan Teder (Reiling Teder & Schrier, LLC), representing the petitioner, stated that this rezone received a favorable staff report as well as a unanimous yes vote from the APC. Handouts provided to the Council show a rendering for the project, drawings from other completed projects that this developer has done on college campuses throughout the United States, the site plan for

this specific project, as well as the parking and unit mix. This developer was also involved in Chauncey Square and Fuse, which were two successful West Lafayette projects. It will be a $40-$50 million project, known as "The Hub," located at Pierce and Wood Streets. He stated that the existing site consists of an older apartment, as well as some older houses, with about 83 beds and approximately 40 parking spaces. The Hub will be a ten-story high-rise building with internal courtyards and three levels of parking. There will be 168 parking spaces, 300 bicycle parking spaces, approximately 30 motorcycle spaces. There will be up to 4 spaces for shared Zipcars, which equals between 30 to 50 additional cars for the space. There will be all amenities for the site, including a gym, steam room, tanning space, game room, and a swimming pool. A public park will be added as the developer works with the Engineering Department on the final detail plans. There will be 270-300 furnished units, and those furnishings will consist of at least a bed, desk, TV, washer, dryer, and a couch. The maximum number of beds will be 599. He stated that they have reviewed the real estate taxes, and presently there are about $50,000 a year for this site. When this project is completed, their opinion is that they will have real estate taxes estimated to be $650,000. This significant increase is hopefully helpful for West Lafayette as well. Mr. Teder stated that this project meets all requirements of the APC, and it conforms to the New Chauncey Plan, the Comprehensive Plan, and the APC's concept land use plan. The parking ratio for this site is 61% per unit, 30% per bed. He stated that he would submit to the Council that this parking ratio reflects the fact that near-campus student housing developments have been over-parked for quite some time. That determination was made by the APC, and the petitioner has done a lot of studies on that. The occupancy rate for student apartments in the near-campus area is over 98%, and the enrollment for Purdue is increasing for at least the near future, and they do not think that what they are going to do will have any negative impact on vacancy. His opinion is that they will be a compliment to all of the hard work that has been done on the State Street project, as he thinks that this will be the crown jewel for the Village area and something that everyone can be proud of.

Councilor DeBoer thanked everyone for the work put into this project, including the process of going through the Joint Board, APC, and Council. He stated that this should serve as an example for any future developments in the area. He stated that he will reiterate the point made about parking, and, he read the following portion of the APC staff report:

> "Clearly we have been over-parking our large, near-campus projects. And while most of the other communities identified in our analysis are larger than ours, their quality of transit and provision of alternative modes of transportation (car sharing, bike sharing, etc…) largely mimics our own with few exceptions. The main difference lies in the provision of public parking infrastructure. Many communities have been lowering or eliminating minimum parking requirements in their core areas in direct proportion to the availability of public (and sometimes private) parking infrastructure."

Councilor DeBoer stated that this has been a shift for the APC, and it is absolutely needed in the downtown area. We have too many parking spaces, and making developers build minimum parking negates the fact that they should probably know what to do with their own capital. If they are investing in that area they should invest in parking if they need to. We just do not need it; there has been a profound shift amongst the younger generation where we prefer walking. The number of parking spots and vacancies that are up in those parking units is part of that. Councilor DeBoer stated that there is now a grocery store on-campus in the Fuse building, thanks to these developers, so students do not need to drive to the grocery store. There is a CVS but thinks that it still does not have a pharmacy, so a pharmacy would be welcome. Councilor DeBoer again expressed his thanks, and stated that he is happy with this project, and it will make this part of his district shine.

Jan Myers (1909 Indian Trail Drive) stated that she felt like the *Nightly Business Report* was following us, because the evening after the last Council meeting the show's featured story was about private apartments being the way to go for most universities. It was about how students are requesting these apartments, and the parents are willing to pay the increased rent. She stated that she just wanted to add that this has been making the recent business news.

John von Erdmannsdorff (owner of Von's Book Shop) stated that he has been in the Village for 48 years, located a block from this development. He stated that he wants to see this development, noting that a friend wants to sell land for it, and it will add 600 customers near his shop. He added that he wants to see that it does not cause more problems than it cures. He provided a letter to the Council regarding his concerns about parking, including current issues with overflow into his lot. He read from the letter, which is attached hereto.

Councilor Thomas stated that he has a friend who owns some apartment property on this space, and she realizes that her apartments are older and dated, and that she cannot compete with the amenities of the newer complexes. He expressed his appreciation to those who have been dealing with her, as his friend felt that it has been a fair process. He stated that he does like the looks of this building, and thinks that it will help with the density issue.

Mr. Teder stated that he feels there is a difference between the larger student apartment complexes and what Mr. von Erdmannsdorff is talking about with the smaller housing type of units. He thinks that there is a difference with parking in regard to that as well. The APC staff report shows what has been done on other campuses, which is not the same as ours, but also shows how the parking garages are half-full at Chauncey Square, Grant Street, and Fuse. He stated that he thinks this is appropriate and appreciates the Council's support.

Councilor DeBoer asked if the developers would be willing to contact these vacant parking garages and lease additional spaces from them if The Hub filled up 100% on parking, if they felt it was in their best interest. Mr. Teder responded that they would.

Councilor DeBoer asked what sort of retail is expected at this location. Mr. Teder responded that they have about 2,400 square feet of retail space available on the Pierce Street side, where they presently have townhouses planned that can be converted to retail. They do not have the appropriate retail space user at this point. Mr. Teder stated that they are seeking that, but his opinion is that it will take time to get that for Pierce Street because retailers are looking at State Street. He thinks that there will be more retail coming in the near future, perhaps south of this, that will come before the Council in six or seven months.

Councilor Wang stated that what he sees is that if a lot of retail is coming, and if you try to attract big businesses and a major chain, people are going to come, and people are going to get squeezed out. Councilor Wang stated if that more people move into The Hub it will add customers for businesses, as Mr. von Erdmannsdorff said, but he is also concerned about parking. His concern is for people getting squeezed out, and maybe people parking in other residencies or streets. He stated that he hears that from people around Fuse.

Steve Bus, representing the developer, stated that with respect to retail parking, they have it as an alternate right now. If retail were to come in, it would reduce the number of beds and units by the amount of space that the retail would occupy. He stated that under the planned development narrative with a required number of parking for retail, that retail coming in does not displace residential parking—it is a swap.

Councilor Dietrich asked if it is correct that the developer is planning to have rooms on the ground floor, as it stands now. Mr. Bus responded that they have it designed as rowhome units, which would be accessed from the sidewalk level. The units are popular with groups in other places where they have had them. President Bunder stated that this is not foreign to the Council, and the same opportunity for retail was done with Grant Street Station.

Mr. Bus stated that as they have talked with retailers, the retailers have said that they want State Street. He stated that it obviously bodes well for the greater State Street Redevelopment Project, and they want to be involved in that discussion going forward. He stated that it takes a little time, and it will happen in the next iteration for development.

Amber von Erdmannsdorff (Von's Dough Shack) stated that she lives on DeHart Street, and that she is curious to know if the planned parking in The Hub will be the same type of stacked spaces as at Fuse, where really only a third of them are desirable or useful as parking places versus storage.

Mr. Bus responded that far fewer of them will be tandem spaces than were in Fuse. He stated that Fuse was a full-block project with a deep floor plate. He stated that what the manager should be doing there is leasing tandem spaces to people in the same unit, so that residents in separate units do not have the stacked condition. Mr. Bus stated that it is one of the changing demographics on campuses, because when you get in this close parking is really car storage. He stated that when a project is two miles from campus you need a parking space out there and a parking space around campus, so you need two parking spaces. When you start to treat all student apartments the same, with one parking space per bedroom, you begin to drive the projects to locations where the land is cheaper and to build it is cheaper. Councilor DeBoer stated that the more parking that has to be built, the more expensive the units are going to be. Mr. Bus stated that more parking means more cost and less affordability of the units, so the unintended consequence is that higher parking ratios drive up the cost of renting apartments. Councilor DeBoer agreed.

Councilor Dietrich asked if residents will have to buy parking permits for these spaces. Mr. Bus responded yes, because there is less parking than beds the parking is leased separately. This is the case at Chauncey, Grant Street Station, and Fuse. He stated that another key thing is that there will be up to four Zipcar car sharing spaces, as demand allows. Another key thing is that there is a transit stop at Pierce and Wood with all-weather coverage.

Thomas Kesler (479 Maple Street) stated that another detail about parking, because it does reach far east on Stadium Avenue, and gives residents on Maple Street an issue. He stated that seeing oncoming traffic is difficult whenever they are going north on Maple and turning on to Stadium during normal business and class hours. He often turns right and goes around the block instead of trying to turn left. Councilor DeBoer stated that he would suggest that this issue is probably due to students commuting to campus from further away, and as Mr. Bus said, two parking spots are necessary for anybody who lives outside of the area and commutes in—one there, one here.

There was no further discussion.

Clerk Booker called the roll call vote:

Councilperson	**Vote**
Bunder	Aye
DeBoer	Aye
Dietrich	Aye

Councilperson	Vote
Jha	Aye
Keen	Aye
Leverenz	Aye
Sanders	Absent
Thomas	Aye
Wang	Aye

Clerk Booker stated that the vote was 8 AYES and 0 NAYS.

President Bunder announced that Ordinance No. 31-16 passed on first and only reading.

Resolution No. 18-16 A Resolution Requesting The Transfer Of Funds (Parks CCD) (Prepared by the Controller)

Councilor Keen read Resolution No. 18-16 by title only, and he moved for its passage on first and only reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor DeBoer.

Controller Gray stated that this resolution is to allow the Parks Department to do some improvements. It moves money to change major categories within the Parks Department's CCD fund.

There was no further discussion.

Clerk Booker called the roll call vote:

Councilperson	Vote
Bunder	Aye
DeBoer	Aye
Dietrich	Aye
Jha	Aye
Keen	Aye
Leverenz	Aye
Sanders	Absent
Thomas	Aye
Wang	Aye

Clerk Booker stated that the vote was 8 AYES and 0 NAYS.

President Bunder announced that Resolution No. 18-16 passed on first and only reading.

REPORT BY THE MAYOR
There was no report.

COMMUNICATIONS
►Councilor Wang stated that he wants to recognize one of our City employees. He noted that the Personnel Committee Report shows that James Hedden in the Street Department has worked here for 40 years. He stated that this is the kind of dedication and loyalty that we do not see often. He expressed his appreciation for Mr. Hedden's dedication with the hard times, especially the weather.

►Councilor Dietrich stated that he would like to offer Mayor John Dennis and many other people some thanks and congratulations on the Morris Schoolhouse issue. He stated that he knows there is still work to do on it, but Lynn Cason has certainly been a friend to the City for a long time, and the fact that the schoolhouse will be saved and possibly incorporated into a new park is exciting. He stated that he knows it was not an easy task, with a lot of moving parts and interest involved in that, so he applauds the Mayor's negotiating skills, and he is very appreciative of that.

►Councilor Keen stated that, regarding the 200th celebration of Indiana on October 12, 2016, there will be a torch run through the community. He encouraged everyone to participate, saying that it will be a nice event for the community to celebrate our history.

CITIZEN COMMENTS

►James Klatch stated that he is a lifelong resident of 1415 Woodland Avenue, and 20 years ago he had an office here at Morton Community Center when he served as the first Beautification Director. He stated that tonight he is representing Residents Rescuing Northwestern Avenue. He stated that everyone that travels on Northwestern between the Cherry Lane stoplight and Mackey Arena, whether by motorized vehicle, bicycle, or foot, faces many unique hazards. He is one of the many bike riders there, and there is no designated bike lane in this gateway. This means that bikers have to either ride illegally on the sidewalk and create conflicts with pedestrians, other bikers, waste bins placed on the curb for pickup, and cars pulling out of driveways and parking lots, or else the bike rider has to share the road with speeding cars, trucks, semis, and busses, praying the whole time that these drivers are not distracted or impaired. Mr. Klatch stated that this chaotic scene is also one of the first impressions visitors experience when they enter the City, and also negatively impacts our neighborhood every day. He stated that Northwestern Avenue is going to be asked to carry an ever-increasing volume of traffic, yet there are no plans to correct the existing design flaws. He stated that our mission is to see that traffic calming features are installed, and that a designated bike lane is created. With all of the resources available locally, West Lafayette can do a much better job with this historic gateway. Mr. Klatch stated that last week he contacted an engineering program at Purdue, and they said they would be interested in helping with this project, depending on what the Council says tonight. There are also many low-cost improvements that could be made tomorrow. He thanked Councilor Sanders for his ongoing help, and he thanked members of the West Lafayette and Purdue Police Departments for ticketing speeders. He stated that we are ready to take the next step.

►Chris Kulesza (1320 Palmer Drive, Apt. 313), Vice-President of Purdue Graduate Student Government (PGSG), stated that he wants to start by being a little unorthodox in his report. He stated that PGSG had an idea session last month about the community, and they asked the question, "When you came to West Lafayette, what surprised you?" One comment that stuck out in his mind was an individual who said that when they came to West Lafayette, compared to other college towns, they were surprised by the fact that our crime rates are so low, and also that the commercial rentals are packed—that we do not have any abandoned buildings. We tend to be a City that does not have many problems, and it seems that graduate students moving to West Lafayette are recognizing what a great community this is. He stated that a couple of things did come up, one of which is rental rates. There is a big concern among graduate students that rental rates continue to increase each year, and wages for graduate students are not increasing at the same rate. Mr. Kulesza stated that he has discussed with a number of Council members the topic of increasing transparency with the rental owners, so that when students go to sign a lease they know everything that is going to be a part of their monthly fees. He explained that some properties are telling them at the last minute that there are additional fees, one of which being what is called a "hassle-free living fee" that is not brought up until the student is signing the lease. He stated that PGSG created a task force to look at that. The other issue is pedestrian and car traffic safety

in general. He stated that he will keep the Council updated as that task force works, and about the community idea sessions that PGSG will hold throughout the academic year.

►Ms. Myers stated that she wants to start with a quote from Shakespeare, and she said, "One touch of nature makes the whole world kin." She would ask us to remember, as we are building high-rise buildings, if we are forgetting that one touch of nature. She asked how much greenery is there on the site of The Hub plan, or what is going to happen at the church, which does have some greenery. She stated that she is delighted to hear about the potential for the one-room school being in a park. She stated that last year she offered to be a resource to teach the community and school children how to plant trees, and she is still available to do that. She suggested that a nursery be put where a row of ash trees was removed along Sagamore Parkway. Ms. Myers stated that there was a mention on the agenda that there was a report done [at Pre-Council] on the emerald ash borer, and she asked if that report is available in print, and she asked why it was not mentioned today. There are big dollars involved in taking down trees, and as part of the budget she thinks we should mention it. Ms. Myers asked why we keep talking about retailing. If you follow the national news, on-site retailing is disappearing. She asked where we think, and why we think that we are going to have retailers in West Lafayette, along State Street, and in these apartment buildings. She stated that someone brought up CVS, and she asked the Council to read their corporate statement in their annual report two or three years ago, which said that they purposely buy leases and install store fronts without ever planning to use it in several instances. They may also install it without putting the pharmacy in. It is a competitive move, and we need to see how they use space. Ms. Myers stated that some asked about the art installations in her yard. She stated that there are art instructors and graduates from the Art Institute of Chicago who are coming to film her yard, because from the photographs they have seen of it, it is an exciting thing for them to do. She stated that once you get past your 70th birthday, you can be funky.

►Mr. Kesler stated that two weeks ago he asked if he had noticed any effect from the efforts of the Neighborhood Resource Team (NRT) around town. He stated that three weeks ago in the alley behind his home some neighbors overfilled their garbage toter to the point that the lid was held open by the garbage bags, and one of the bags had rolled out partway across the alley. Two days later, the Street Department came through and took the bags, and he followed behind bagging what was left on the alley. On Sunday he was in the same alley bagging garbage from two locations: 473 Maple and 472 North Salisbury. He stated that he had complained before about the owner of 472 North Salisbury using the alley as a landfill. He spoke about litter that he picked up on two trails during recent hikes. He stated that, in short, no he is not seeing the effect of the NRT efforts. He stated that he is still seeing the same uncovered trash cans, and noted that he is planning to go back on litter patrol in the alley between Stadium and Sylvia. President Bunder thanked Mr. Kesler for the report and the work he does in their neighborhood.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business at this time, Councilor DeBoer moved for adjournment, and President Bunder adjourned the meeting the time being 7:33 p.m.

Letter from John von Erdsmannsdorff to the Council regarding Ordinance No. 31-16:

The Hub, parking and other considerations.

Most of us believe in greater density and continued development near campus. 600 more customers living in the same block with my business doesn't sound like a bad thing. Unfortunately if those customers don't have adequate parking it can be disastrous to surrounding areas.

Based on my 48 years in the Village, it would be well to consider a few facts before considering the myths that parking is no longer needed in hub areas.

1) My most common number of tenant cars for all these years has been one car per tenant/bedroom. Today I have only 12 bedrooms and each of the 12 people have a car and one of the 12 reserved parking places.

2) I have had to use additional store parking for years to accommodate overnight guests who have become more and more common in recent years. (On a Friday or Saturday night, how many of the 600 residents will have guests over and where will they park if there is not even one space per bedroom?)

3) One of the top three categories of violators in my parking lot are tenants and guests of the other apartments in the area even though they have about one parking space per bedroom. One space per bedroom in the very space the Hub will be located has not been enough for the existing less dense apartments. I have had to warn, ticket and tow the overflow from my parking. Most overflow then ends up on the city streets or as violators in the lots of others.

4) My customers continue to tell me that the single reason they avoid the Village whenever possible is the lack of sufficient parking for other businesses in the area.

I agree that there are reasons for exceptions to parking requirements for both living spaces and businesses. A designated pedestrian only area won't need much customer parking although there still need to be places for employees and deliveries and you will have to sacrifice any existing businesses which depend upon car traffic. A home with four bedrooms and several little children doesn't require four parking spots. A business that is 90% delivery doesn't need as much space as one with customers present. An establishment that serves alcohol does not want a parking space for every customer since they cannot drive after drinking. The Hub must tell you what kind of business and how much space will be devoted to business before you can decide how much parking is needed for customers, employees and delivery vehicles. You must know the nature of the retail and how much space before you can decide what parking to require. If it is an "anything goes" situation then you must plan for the worst case scenario and require the maximum number of parking spaces for the designated space.

Some comment needs to be made about the "statistics" used to promote the myth that all hub areas may now do well without usual parking. (Incidentally, I recommend the book How to Lie with Statistics to anyone who wishes to be informed and not misled by data atone.)

1) Un-leased parking spots in another development don't mean that parking spots aren't needed in other developments. They don't even mean that the development with un-leased spaces has enough. It is more likely that other factors such as too high cost and or too poor accessibility is the cause of vacancies. Expensive parking pushes people to park outside their building and exacerbate parking problems in surrounding areas. "A" parking at the Fuse costs $720 per year. "B" and "C" parking is less but it is stacked behind "A" spots with no valet to move the "A" cars. In "B" and "C" parking you can't get your car out unless the "A" parking person happens to be gone. Your car could be parked in for days or weeks! This is long term storage, not parking. Now people living nearby in some New Chauncey areas can no longer park in front of their homes. Fuse tenants have filled surrounding streets. Do you know how the parking will be laid out at the Hub? I pray that the arrangement is not like the Fuse where only a third of the spaces are actually usable. Even if there was a program to move outside cars to free inner ones, the hassle and wait may drive the tenants to free street parking.

2) The number of people without vehicles is finite. As more places with insufficient parking are added, it is more and more likely that there will be too few parking places for that development and for the next development until the whole area begins to suffer.
3) Consider hard data re the parking lots for present apartments in the area. They are filled solid and even overflow from August to May even though there are nearly an even number of spaces and bedrooms. This is demonstrable specific local evidence of needed apartment parking for the exact area of concern.
4) The fact that a few other communities have eased their restrictions for new developments does not mean that it is good for our community. Boulder Colorado's successful Pearl Street pedestrian mall was often cited when people thought other towns should close streets and create pedestrian malls. Some places who did so have to pay the penalty of having to spend money again to undo such changes later because what was good for some cities was not good for all.

Consider the precedent being set as first one and then another such development goes in with only a fraction of the parking previously needed. Does Chauncey Hill Mall get the same deal to redevelop? What about where the Lutheran church now stands? What about my location?
1) We might get away without disastrous effects with the first favored development, but all problems are exacerbated as such development continues.
2) If the city government creates this problem, will it be expected to buy ground and build a parking garage to alleviate the problem as other cities have had to pay to fix their mistakes? Retroactively, you won't get it fixed by the developers.

Personally I am already exploring what could survive in my space if I am forced to close because of more regular customers abandoning the area and more expenses as I am forced to monitor my parking 24 hours per day and maintain it when the new development sends Its existing tenants across my property as if it were a public alley. If this is the vehicular future of the Village area, changes will have to be made and the ramifications will be major.

I can understand relaxing requirements on existing space, but find it difficult to understand penalizing all present businesses, apartments and homes by allowing new development to leach upon their space. I suppose it is the job of any new developer to try to get away with as much as possible—do whatever he can to minimize his expense even if at the expense of all of his neighbors, but hopefully it is your job to limit damage done to the rest of the city by reasonable regulation. From a freedom stand point I can understand letting someone do whatever they want with their property, but even then one person's freedom should not cause harm to others.

If no additional parking is included I think I should invest in a towing company because I am confident that there will be more earned from tow fees than from running a retail bookstore.

Sincerely,
John van Erdmannsdorff