Minutes
West Lafayette Historic Preservation Commission
Morton Community Center
222 N. Chauncey Avenue
West Lafayette, IN 47906
June 14, 2016

The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Chris Kulesza, President, who presided.

Present: Peter Bunder, Erin Britton, Susan Curtis, Chris Kulesza, Dale Dixon, Arnold Sweet, Kurt Wahl, Shelly Lowenberg-DeBoer
Absent: Kelly Busch, Linda Martin, Jim Sondgeroth

Chris Kulesza asked if there were any objections to May 10, 2016 minutes. Without any objection, Commission members approved unanimously.

519 Evergreen Street

President Kulesza asked property owner to come to the table as their property is being discussed. Kurt Wahl gave the staff report that pertains to 519 Evergreen Street. The property owner wished to remove the garage and replace with parking spaces. Kurt Wahl concluded that there is no historic fabric on the garage itself, yet he could not determine if the structure was original to the main house. Commissioner Bunder, the Certificate of Appropriateness subcommittee chair, states that the minutes and Wahl accurately depicted the conversation pertaining to 519 Evergreen Street. Commissioner Bunder also expressed reluctance to removing the garage.

Susan Curtis questioned Commissioner Bunder's reluctances to removing the garage to provide parking spaces as there is a lack of street parking within the neighborhood itself. Commissioner Bunder states most homeowners during this particular time period had a one car garage and is the general look of the neighborhood today.

Commissioner Britton stated that the garage can be seen from the street and if the garage was removed, one would see a parking lot within a backyard. Commissioner Britton also feels that the window on the garage is a historical feature and a factor to consider.

Gary Schroeder, the applicant for 519 Evergreen Street, stated that he purchased the property a year ago and there is currently not enough parking. Under the current zoning ordinance, he is required to have three off street parking spaces, but being so close to the university, there is not much parking available.

Commissioner Lowenberg-DeBoer ask the applicant if there was any way to hide the parking spaces and the vehicles from the street with landscape. The applicant stated interest in this concept. Commissioner Lowenberg-DeBoer also spoke about safety concern and difficulty backing out form the garage.

Commissioner Cutris spoke of competing conflicts: aesthetics, safety, and overall neighborhood interest. Kurt Wahl followed Commissioner Curtis' statement, questioning the applicant if he plans to build any new structure. The applicant said he has no plans of building any new garage structure, but rather create surface parking. He also mentioned that parking pads are consistent with the neighborhood as well.

Presiding president opened the floor to public comments. Thomas Kessler stepped forward, mentioning there is a house on Sylvia where he has seen as many as eight cars in the back yard. He also mentioned that a house on Lutz had a similar issue. Susan Kessler expressed concern for the aesthetics of the neighborhood as a whole. She also stated that there are visibility issues, especially into alleyways or ramps. As for 519 Evergreen Street, she mentioned that landscaping could be of use to hide the parking spaces, perhaps use of creative fencing with windows.

President Kulesza moved to accept the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted, allow for a demolition of the garage. Commissioner Curtis seconded.

Vote: Yes- Shelly Lowenberg-DeBoer
No- Peter Bunder, Erin Britton, Susan Curtis, Chris Kuleza, Arnold Sweet

The final vote was 1 yes and 5 no. The Certificate of Appropriateness was rejected as is.

443 Robinson Street

Kurt Wahl gave the staff report for 443 Robinson Street. He stated that there are several historic features to this home. This Certificate of Appropriateness is to build a second story addition on the west side of the home. Concern that this addition throw the house out of balance was noted. After consideration of a past addition, this addition would not. There are two historic windows that should be reused. Kurt Wahl also read the Secretary of Interior Standards #9.

Commissioner Curtis and Kurt Wahl discussed the exact location of the addition. The sub-committee unanimously approved this project, as Commissioner Bunder explained the contactor of this project has does a tremendous job in matching historical features is past projects.

President Kulesza opens to public comment. Thomas Kessler spoke, questioning if the style of the house would change. Kurt Wahl reassured that they style would not change and his concern was about the balance of the house, which the balance would also would not be thrown with this addition. Commissioner Bunder stated that the addition does not need to match exactly, but match the style.

President Kulesza moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to approve this addition on the exception that they would comply with the Secretary of Interior Standards # 9 and that the builder would work with the city to ensure compliance. Susan Curtis seconded.

Vote: Yes- Peter Bunder, Erin Britton, Susan Curtis, Chris Kulesza, Shelly Lowenberg-DeBoer
Arnold Sweet
No-

The final vote was 6 yes and 0 no. The Certificate of Appropriateness to approve this addition on the exception that they would comply with the Secretary of Interior Standards # 9 and that the builder would work with the city to ensure compliance was approved.

303 E. Stadium Street

Kurt Wahl gave the staff report for 303 E. Stadium Street. The applicant wishes to enclose the existing carport. There will be no change to the roof line as well as no change to the façade from the garage door overs. The siding will match the existing house, Wahl adding that his project does not affect the integrity of the existing house. The sub-committee has no issues with this Certificate of Appropriateness and unanimously approved of this application.

The applicant distributed photos of what the garage door would look like, explain that the door will be a single steel garage door with a brown wood color to match the mid-century modern style of the house.

Commissioner Britton state that enclosing this carport would change the aesthetics of the house, as carports were very popular in the 60's. Commissioner Sweet commented, pointing out that many mid-century homes in his neighborhood have been filling in their carports with doors.

Commissioner Bunder moved to vote on the approval of this Certificate of Appropriateness to enclose the carport. Susan Curtis seconded.

Vote: Yes-Peter Bunder, Susan Curtis, Chris Kulesza, Shelly Lowenberg-DeBoer
No-Erin Britton, Arnold Sweet

The final vote was 4 yes and 2 no. The Certificate of Appropriateness was approved.

Resolution 2016-1

Currently, the ordinance allows for the city staff to approve certain changes to structures that are not original. Commission Curtis questioned the installation of storm windows and what that would entail. Commissioner Sweet questioned if roofing material can be changed without the commission approving. Commission Britton stated concerns of city staff approving changes to home aesthetics without consulting a historic expert. Dale Dixon spoke to regarding the step-by-step procedures he plans to use.

The purpose of Resolution 2016-1 is to reduce the work of the commission and is based off of a similar resolution from Lafayette. This resolution shows a certain amount of competency and good will between the Engineering and Development Department of West Lafayette. The resolution would take effect in September.

Commissioner Bunder moved to approve Resolution 2016-1. Susan Curtis seconded the motion.

Vote: Yes-Peter Bunder, Erin Britton, Susan Curtis, Chris Kulesza, Shelly Lowenberg-DeBoer, Arnold Sweet.
No-

The final vote was 6 yes and 0 no. The Resolution 2016-1 was approved.

Discussion regarding prior COA Approvals

Kurt Wahl spoke regarding a carport that was added without any building permits. The homeowners were supposed to remedy this situation and change the angled roofline, but has not been done. President Kulesza suggested that a letter be sent to the homeowners asking what happened and to seek answers. Commissioner Britton asked what the ramifications are if the homeowner does not fix the issue. Commissioner Bunder stated the violation of not having a building permit or comply with the permit, a $2,500.00 fine could be applied. The enforcement of the fine would be with the Department of Engineering. Chad Spitznagle explained the best way to spell out the process and fine to future permit holders or those who build without an appropriate permit for a project within the New Chauncey historic neighborhood. Chad Spitznagle would also explain the fines if the permit holder does not comply with the approved Certificate of Appropriateness.

512 Salisbury

Chad Spitznagle spoke regarding the property and the recent changes. Commissioner Bunder questioned if demolition permits were needed. Commissioner Britton expressed that there was no communication with the Historic Preservation Commission about the demolition of the garage. President Kulesza and Commissioner Curtis discussed the approved Certificate of Appropriateness that was approved by the commission. Dale Dixon spoke on the matter, stating that the commission would speak to Dale Dixon for the city to resolve issues like this.

President Kulesza opened to public comment. Susan Kessler spoke on the 512 Salisbury matter, explaining she lives behind the property. The property owner is not on site often. Between 3 and 5 pm one afternoon, there was shouting in the alleyway. The owner was very upset that the contractor threw away the historic materials.

President Kulesza believes the approved project has changed and needs to be resubmitted the sub-committee. Kurt Wahl and Commissioner Bunder spoke regarding this.

541 Hayes

The application for this property stated that the concrete front porch and steps were to be rebuilt. Railing will also be replaced. The issue of discussion is whether this project needs a Certificate of Appropriateness or not. Kurt Wahl stated that the concrete repair and the steps repair is considered maintenance. Railing would require a Certificate of Appropriateness in phase 2. The Historic Preservation Commission agrees.

Update from Kurt Wahl and Staff

No updates from Kurt Wahl and Staff. Chad Chad Spitznagle spoke on Mr. Schroeder's application. Commissioner Bunder spoke regarding Mr. Schroeder's application.

President Kulesza spoke regarding a new committee and asked for volunteers to develop an educational pamphlet to be distributed throughout the neighborhood association. Commissioner Curtis, Commissioner Sweet, and Commissioner Britton volunteered and were all appointed and approved by the commission.

Public Comment

Thomas Kessler, home owner of 479 Maple Street, spoke regarding 512 Salisbury and the efforts of the Historic Preservation Commission. He also spoke further regarding the garage at 512 Salisbury and materials can be salvaged and reused.

Susan Kessler spoke on repurposing old windows. There are many people who have old windows that they can use for garages. Habitat for humanity and the Re-store has old windows that can be used.

Mr. Schroeder spoke regarding the compliance and he wants to do that. He thinks the overlay zoning will do that.

Commissioner Curtis moved to adjourn. Commissioner Bunder seconded. Adjourned unanimously at 7:57 pm.

Kelly Busch, ~~Secretary~~
Christopher Nelson