

CITY OF WEST LAFAYETTE  
COMMON COUNCIL  
MINUTES  
June 4, 2012

The Common Council of the City of West Lafayette, Indiana, met in the West Lafayette Junior/Senior High School Auditorium, 1105 N. Grant Street, West Lafayette, on June 4, 2012, at the hour of 6:30 p.m.

Mayor Dennis called the meeting to order and presided.

The Pledge of Allegiance was repeated.

Present: Bunder, Burch, Dietrich, Hunt, Keen, Thomas, and VanBogaert.  
Absent: None

Also present were City Attorney Burns, Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes, Public Works Director Buck, Police Chief Dombkowski, Street Commissioner Downey, Human Resources Director Foster, Fire Chief Heath, WWTU Director Henderson, Parks Superintendent Payne, Information Technology Manager Newman, and Director of Development Poole.

#### MINUTES

Councilor Keen moved for acceptance of the minutes of the May 3, 2012, Pre-Council Meeting, the May 7, 2012, Common Council Meeting and the May 24, 2012 Executive Session. Councilor Burch seconded the motion, and the motion passed by voice vote.

#### COMMITTEE STANDING REPORTS, FINANCIAL REPORTS, LEGAL REPORTS

Mayor Dennis announced these reports will be on file in the Clerk-Treasurer's Office.

#### REPORT OF APC REPRESENTATIVE

Councilor Keen presented this report. He announced the Area Plan Commission Meeting will be held on June 20, 2012 at the Tippecanoe County Building. Four things on the agenda are West Lafayette projects. These include the State Street Corner rezone project (from CBW to PDMX), the Schroeder Meridian Crossing project, the John and Connie Basham rezone project at 320 & 326 South Chauncey, and the Stadium Capital project at 720 Northwestern Avenue.

#### SPECIAL REPORTS AND NOMINATIONS:

The 2012 Tax Abatement Compliance Review and the Nomination to Fill Term on Human Relations Commission were addressed at the May 31, 2012 Pre-Council meeting.

#### PUBLIC RELATIONS

##### West Lafayette Community Beautification Award

Councilor Keen announced that the winner of the June 2012 West Lafayette Beautification Award was Westport Neighborhood Association. The 20-year-old planned development, just off Soldiers Home Road is surrounded by large planting beds, common gardens, and private gardens which hold many landscape features including mature evergreens, Japanese maples, water features including waterfalls, hydrangeas, shrubs and many

varieties of flowers. The ash trees in the neighborhood have been treated for the last five consecutive years and currently show no signs of infestation by the emerald ash bore. Of the 26 total acres in Westport, 13 acres are devoted to green space. Jim Bodenmiller and Jim Windle, President and Vice President of Westport Neighborhood Association, accepted the award on behalf of the neighborhood.

Mr. Bodenmiller thanked the City of West Lafayette for the award. He said he was pleased to be here on behalf of the residents and honored to accept the award on behalf of the Westport Neighborhood Association. He said that the neighborhood is a wonderful community with a park-like atmosphere, and filled with caring neighbors who look out for each other and it is a wonderful place to live.

Mr. Windle said he was proud to accept the prestigious award and told the City of West Lafayette to keep up the great work.

### UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Ordinance No. 11-12 An Ordinance Authorizing The City Of West Lafayette, Indiana To Issue Its "Economic Development Revenue Bond, Series 2012 (Faith West Project)" And Approving Other Actions In Respect Thereto (Sponsored by Mayor Dennis)

Mayor Dennis read Ordinance No. 11-12 by title.

Mayor Dennis noted that this is the second and final reading, and is the third hurdle the ordinance has gone through publicly. He recalled that, as he observed at the Economic Development Commission (EDC) meeting, this is a project that was done right. He said he is looking at the project purely from an economic development standpoint. The project is to be developed on a blighted site that has been an eyesore for years. Originally the property was a Family Inn. When the Family Inn left the site, several business owners tried to utilize the site for various endeavors but none of them were successful. The parcel is in a good location with a lot of traffic that goes by. When the parcel went up for sale, the first group that came in wanted to develop a property with retail and rental apartments, with the main focus being on college students. There were many aspects of that project to which the surrounding neighbors objected, including facets of the structure itself and concerns about how the quality of life in the neighborhood would be affected. The project did not move forward, partly due to negative changes in the economy.

The second investors presented the same type of plan, looking at creating a retail/residential property, but changing it around a little bit, based on some of the feedback the first investor had received from neighbors around the property. Again, because of dissatisfaction of the neighbors and economic factors, the second development fell through as well. The property sat and sat and sat, and the parcel became a blight on the community. It was difficult to find someone even willing to cut the grass, or anyone willing to level the property to alleviate a developing mosquito breeding ground in the center of the property. The neighbors became very, very unhappy, and understandably so. The neighbors wanted something that would replace the eyesore and give them an improved quality of life.

Mayor Dennis said the next investor who came along was Faith Church. The first thing they did was come to the Mayor's Office and ask him what he thought. He told them, "I'm going to tell you straight up what I think. You need to be sure that whatever you do with this project it fits the plan of the neighbors. The neighborhood has many permanent

residents who take great pride in their neighborhood. So you need to be sure that whatever you do, you need to make sure the neighbors approve.” So Faith Church went out to the neighbors and went door to door canvassing the neighborhood, asking the neighbors, “What do you want to see on the property? What would be a good fit?” The input was given by the neighbors both in personal meetings and at neighborhood meetings. The input was to lay out what would be good for the neighbors at the site, not just what would be good for the investors.

Faith Church also went to meet with the Engineer’s Office. There were a lot of things that needed to be done at that site, not just to make it palatable for the neighbors, but also palatable for the City. Those things included addressing drainage issues, walkways, storm water run-off issues, and things which would make the property appealing. So now we are at the final reading of a project that has already been approved by the EDC and has met the needs of those most intimately involved in the project, the neighborhood surrounding the property.

Mayor Dennis said that the first rule of those who wish to speak about the issue, is to treat each other with respect. He asked for a show of hands of how many people wanted to speak tonight. He said he would try to limit the speakers to two minutes each. Mayor Dennis reminded everyone that the reason they would be coming up to speak would be to give the Council information that would help them make a more informed decision. He asked for a lack of duplication if an issue has already been clearly mentioned by another speaker. Being repetitive is not as beneficial as bringing new information to the Council that has not already been stated. Mayor Dennis reminded everyone that at the end of the day, what happens here happens. We are here because we are all intellectually gifted enough to understand that sometimes there is a winner and sometimes there is a loser. But, when we leave the stage we leave as one. We are all still members of the same community as friends and neighbors.

Councilor Keen moved that Ordinance No. 11-12 be passed on second and final reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor Burch.

Councilor Bunder said he thinks that Faith West is a fine project and voted for the zoning change for the project. Last month he voted against Ordinance 11-12 for the Economic Development Revenue (EDR) bond for the project. He said the Council can issue the EDR bond but we do not have to issue these bonds and he does not believe we should. He said that this is not a project like the Westminster Village addition. He believes this proposal violates the common sense of separation of church and state.

Councilor Bunder said three economic development arguments can be made against the project. He noted that the president of the Economic Development Commission, Mr. Baitinger, voted against the project and believes, as does Councilor Bunder, that the proposal offers very little in economic development. Councilor Bunder said the project involves issuance of \$7 million dollars in bonds for \$1 million dollars in jobs. He said there is little or no tax revenue to the City. Councilor Bunder said he would like to cite Director of Development Poole’s statement at Pre-Council regarding current tax abatements resulting in between 900 and 1,000 jobs. He said he would also like to ask the City to recall the Clerk-Treasurer’s statement that State fiscal policies in the form of circuit breaker, will result in a recent increase in circuit breaker that will cost the City \$230,000 in revenue next year. Councilor Bunder said there will be increased economic activity at the Northwestern Avenue site, but measured against an empty lot. He said we should be able and competent enough to put something on that lot which will enhance City revenue for

the next thirty years. Councilor Bunder stated that economic development usually increases the tax base and this is not economic development. Councilor Bunder SAID that Mr. Baitinger concluded that this, meaning Faith West, could be done by the private sector, and he agrees.

Councilor Bunder said his second argument against the project would be a “community of choice” argument. He said it is an argument that helps explain why the word “Baptist” is disappearing from churches. He asked everyone to consider the Southern Baptist name change. Commissioned by the business organization, the Greater Lafayette Chamber of Commerce, a study was conducted to see what might make people, particularly young adults, pick Lafayette and West Lafayette, instead of seeing us as simply accidental to Purdue University. Councilor Bunder said we do well with retirees in our community, not so well with young adults. The Georgetown University Public Research Institution makes the point, repeated by so many other studies, that “millennials”, young adults aged 18 to 24, think that contemporary Christianity is too judgmental (62% in this study). In the same study, 64% of “millennials” also disapprove of the anti-gay attitudes of churches. Councilor Bunder said to emphasize the importance of the later statistic, he would mention the work done by Richard Florida, whose work on the creative class was lauded by the Harvard Business Review, and who is now the director of the University of Toronto’s Rottman School of Management’s Prosperity Institute. In 2003, Dr. Florida was brought here by an event sponsored by Purdue University, the Greater Lafayette Chamber of Commerce, Tippecanoe Arts Federation, and Vision 2020. Councilor Bunder said the creative class views the treatment of gay and lesbian persons as a canary in a coal mine. Councilor Bunder asked, “How safe is our environment for creative people?” He said he knows that Faith Baptist understands itself to be a force for good, gracious, kind, righteous. Councilor Bunder said it helps explain the imperiousness of some of the comments of bond counsel: “How dare you question us?”, “You must be stupid,” “You must hate religion.” Councilor Bunder stated that a majority of people, he included, believe Faith is a force for good. He said that the Council must be aware that for many people Faith Baptist is simply a neutral. They feel that something ought to go on the lot, so it may as well be Faith West. For others this business has some negatives, particularly for those whom we have determined we want to attract. Councilor Bunder asked, “Why?” He continued by saying that the project has very high negatives for gay and lesbians, very high negatives for those who are concerned about the status of women, and very high negatives for those who fear attacks on science from religion. He added that the long range economic health of this community may in fact not be served by issuing the bond. He said it may, in fact, serve to discourage entrepreneurs who will create lots of jobs and who have lots of places to pick from. He said if Faith is built with bonds issued by the City, there will be obvious effects on the environment. He repeated that 62% of adults aged 18 to 24 years old think that contemporary Christianity is too judgmental and 64% disapprove of the anti-gay attitude of churches.

Councilor Bunder concluded his arguments by saying that as a small business owner he will be negatively impacted by this construction, not because Faith will steal Episcopalians, but because his small business, like the town’s largest employer, Purdue University, must recruit nationally and internationally. He said his leadership come in equal parts from local national and international locations. He said recruitment is hard work and retention is an even bigger problem. He said he regularly gets phone calls from people who are coming to interview for jobs here and are asking what the community is really like. He said he also regularly gets phone calls from parents as admission deadlines at Purdue approach, asking what kind of place the community is. This spring

his office got a call from a gay parent whose child is still unsure of his or her sexual identity, wanting to know if the community would be a safe environment for their child. Councilor Bunder asked everyone to consider what it would be like for them if their child was gay. He said outside "our bubble" Indiana makes news for a State Senator's attack on the girl scouts, for a Republican attack on a gay youth organization's license plate which took down a 4-H plate as collateral damage. He said there is also the anti-gay amendment to the constitution, opposed by the likes of Eli Lilly and Cummins, for the reasons mentioned in his second argument. He remarked that Senator Lugar's defeat was a far bigger deal outside the State than inside of it. Councilor Bunder said that we are not Wyoming-Matthew Shepard-dangerous. Councilman Bunder said Judy Shepard has spoken at Purdue University, but the parent is asking whether of all the places in the country where they could send their child, was this was a good place to send their child to wrestle with the questions of identity and intimacy. He said that ordinarily on gay and women's issues when he is questioned on the City's receptiveness to those issues he leads with the City's Human Relations Commissions work because he is proud of it. He said he doubted there was any public review of Faith Church's EDR bond application by the City's Human Relations Commission. He said our City still has problems using the term sexual orientation in our discussions. Councilor Bunder noted that Laura Blackburn, recently named by the Council to fill a term on the Human Relations Commission, has a great resume but is also past president of the Queer Organization at Purdue. He said that fact was hidden, but should have been celebrated and put in the City newsletter, because it shows we are serious about involving Purdue students in City government, and proves we are a more diverse institution than would appear at first glance. Councilor Bunder said that one day the City will have a gay or lesbian City Councilperson. He noted that Purdue University has just hired its first LGBT director, but said the director's job just got harder. So he will vote no.

Councilor Keen said it was premature to speculate on how much is or is not taxable on the property, as the Property Tax Assessment Board of Appeals has not yet ruled or made any determination on that issue.

Councilor Dietrich said on his day job he received calls from parents all the time asking if the community was safe for their child. He noted that that concern or request is not solely that of a gay parent. Everybody has that concern when their children are going to any college community. He said that while he understands Councilor Bunder's thoughts, it certainly is not solely in their realm.

Councilor Hunt said she wanted to reserve her comments until the end.

Mayor Dennis opened the comments to the public and asked each person to state their name and address.

Arvid Olson (24 Fairfieldview Court) stated, "Good evening. One of my community outreach involvements is serving on the Chamber Council Board of Greater Lafayette Commerce (GLC). Having respected the work of Jodie Hamilton, GLC's Economic Development Director, I requested a projected economic impact report for Faith West. The metrics used reflect the ripple effect of project construction and job creation in the West Lafayette Community and surrounding areas. Many here know people in the construction trades who have left our community due to the rough economy. We are excited to be able to provide more than 100 construction jobs, in addition to more than 40 indirect supplier and consumer jobs throughout the construction phase of Faith West. This economic development activity will create personal income exceeding \$5,942,000,

and a total economic output impact of more than \$15,367,000. Regarding the impact of 18 new direct jobs at Faith West, Ms. Hamilton provided the following analysis: the addition of these employees provides a personal income boost to the community of more than \$460,000 annually. The ripple effect will create an additional four new private sector jobs in our community, resulting in more than \$580,000 in annual local personal income. Using GLC methods, there is a positive job creation in the Faith West project construction phase providing income for more than 140 local workers. In addition, there is the permanent creation of 18 jobs, plus four additional community jobs. The cumulative effect is a total economic annual impact in excess of \$1,215,000 each year. Lastly, I would note that among local not for profit organizations, 18 employees places Faith West into the top one quarter of all not for profits within Tippecanoe County. If you factor in the salary and benefits of all 185 2013 Faith West and Faith East personnel, the amount exceeds \$4,600,000 before estimating total economic impact, ranking Faith among the top ten not for profits serving our area.”

James Hengenius (2550 Yeager Road) stated, “So I have two concerns regarding this project, one you’ve already heard about from Councilman Bunder, and that is the limited impact of 18 or possibly 22 permanent jobs created in the community, so I’m not going to belabor that in my two minutes. The other issue came up at the May 7<sup>th</sup> meeting and at that time we heard that the Faith West project would be examined from Equal Employment Opportunity and the City Human Relations Commission rules. So considering that, what did we see here? We heard that the bulk of the hires would be from the Faith Ministry Seminary program. Now despite that, normally there are only ministerial exceptions for hiring related to directly religious positions, things like a pastor or pastor’s aid. When you look at the 18 jobs that are created in the application, we see that fully half of them are secretarial, they are custodial, facilities management and if you don’t include preschool teachers as a predominantly religious function, then more than half of the jobs will be non-religious. And I don’t think that they’d be subject to that exemption, so I’m curious why that so many of these jobs will not be offered to the greater Lafayette community, why doesn’t everyone have the opportunity to apply?”

Mayor Dennis asked the Council if they wanted to go ahead and have the questions asked and answered or wait until the public speaking is over and answer them. Councilor VanBogaert responded that at the Economic Development Commission Meeting a list of the questions was made and they were addressed at the end of the meeting.

Bill Rogers (124 N 580 W) stated, “I have the privilege of serving as Chief Financial Officer at Faith Ministries. I think it’s important to realize that the 140 plus construction and service jobs in addition to the 18 plus permanent jobs generated by Faith West is just going to be the beginning of the economic impact from this project. Why is that? Because what we’ve experienced on the East side of town is that Faith is a hub of community service activity that generates substantial profit for area businesses. For example, last week I generated a report of all the checks we wrote to area businesses in the last twelve months, and that report was 1,001 pages long. Some of the highlights of that report were \$324,200 spent on food services, \$105,700 spent on maintenance supplies, \$95,700 just for printing bills, \$102,500 spent in local restaurants, \$143,700 to local service contractors, \$718,700 in insurance premiums, \$85,000 in copier leases, \$205,000 in technology equipment, \$49,100 in those t-shirts our kids wear in our youth leagues. So the true economic impact of these bonds is really going to start affecting local business and organizations slightly more than one year after Faith West opens its doors. We’re looking forward to being a very good local customer and community asset.”

Mary Tilden (3308 Jasper Street) stated "Members of City Council, Mr. Mayor, Ladies and Gentleman I am here tonight to register my opposition to the Faith West bond issue. The issue we are dealing with is whether Faith, excuse me, whether West Lafayette should use its borrowing power to assist Faith Church to raise money to extend its ministry into West Lafayette by describing it as economic development. I won't reiterate the arguments regarding this project's lack of real economic development although there has been some counter argument to that. Unfair competition with local businesses, etc. They have been well covered by others in letters to the editor and I expect they will also be addressed this forum. And there is, in my mind, clearly little economic gain for the City. However, if the City passes this bond issue it will open itself up to discrimination lawsuits unless it approves similar bond issues from other religious groups. In addition, it is disturbing that the City is supporting a group that doesn't have to comply with its Human Relations Ordinances. As one of the retirees in this City, who is satisfied with this City, I find it a negative message to send to potential progressive entrepreneurs and residents who might consider relocating to West Lafayette. In the end the major beneficiary of this project is Faith Church, not the City of West Lafayette. Public statements by Pastor Viars indicate that the Church has considerable borrowing power. That being the case, the City should now ask Faith Church to take advantage of its private borrowing power to secure the funding for Faith West. That is the course West Lafayette should have followed in the first place. Thank you."

Mayor Dennis said he would like to add a quick note on that. He said he met on Friday with the President of the Human Relations Commission and Faith Church as it stands right now is in compliance with all the rules and regulations of the City's Human Relations Commission. He said one of the things they wanted him to communicate is that the City will get an assurance that they will continue to be in compliance with the Human Relations Commission.

Dr. Trevor Murray (1010 Kingswood Road West) said, "Hi. In Lafayette, over the past sixteen years, my business has become one of the top cosmetic dental practices in the country. In November, 2011 I opened Foxes Pizza, in front of Meijer, about a half mile from Faith Church. Not knowing anything about pizza, it was one of the riskiest investments I have ever made. With all that said, we've been in business seven months and we were breaking even after four months. We're currently doing very well and I contribute much of the success to being located close to Faith, Faith Community, Faith Community Center, and then local businesses around our area. We make pizzas for many Faith events and Faith members and friends are constant to our doors. Working with Faith has been a win-win situation for both us at Foxes Pizza and for Faith. As people of West Lafayette will see they'll always win more when working with people at Faith.

Warren Eckels (2550 Yeager Road) said, "Good evening. While I am not a member of the Church of the Flying Spaghetti Monster, one of their clergy has given me permission to speak on their behalf. In his words the sauce is upon me. I don't know what that means. Anyway, you may remember that Fazoli's is closed. What that means is that one of the sources of the agape meals of that particular church is no longer available. It has been suggested that they open a ministry here in West Lafayette for people who are hungry. Or at least who want spaghetti according to the diverse ancient venerable usages of that church. So, as it appear now, that Faith Community Church is asking for the blessing of the community. All I'm saying is that any other church, any other church, any

other civic group be allowed the same blessings under the same conditions, and that such conditions be written out and plain, plain. Here is, from what I understand, the Flying Spaghetti Monster Church's goals: One, open a place that serves spaghetti, both according to the various usages, both sacramental and non-sacramental. Second, that should be affordable, it should be for people. Now granted, we don't think it should be free, necessarily, because obviously Faith Church is going to charge rent for some of their student housing. So that the Spaghetti Monster Church decides that it too can charge a reasonable price for its services. It would be wages such that reflect well upon the Church of the Spaghetti Monster. They do not seek to scandalize the church by poor treatment of their employees. Finally, it is a fundamental principal of that church that all principals of the human rights ordinances passed by West Lafayette be followed. So all I'm saying is that I guess it is not for or against the Faith Church ordinance. It's just a request and a reminder that whatever conditions are set upon Faith Church or lack of conditions set upon Faith Church will be applied by other churches. Perhaps not the Church of the Flying Spaghetti Monster. If they are not wanted they could not truly settle in the community. This cannot be said of all organizations. I guess I've said my piece. Have a good day."

Beth Goodman, (3308 Jasper Street) stated, "Good evening members of City Council and Mr. Mayor. I am here regrettably tonight, in opposition to the City of West Lafayette's intentions to secure economic revenue bonds for the construction of a project to be owned and operated by Faith Church within the City of West Lafayette. As has already been said, you have heard all the arguments so I will not either go over them again. However, what I am unfortunately here to do tonight is express in the strongest possible terms, my profound disappointment at the leadership of the City government allowed this divisive issue to get this far. The City leaders, had the opportunity I believe, to decline the issuance of such bonds due to the slippery slope it creates in the obvious inappropriateness of the request, when first approached by Faith Church. It is simply not a wise or prudent arrangement for any government entity to enter into any type of financial agreement with any type of faith based entity. But as the Mayor has already shared with us, we know how desperate the City is to fill this lot on Northwestern. It isn't conceivable to me how anyone could possibly perceive any part of this project to be secular. In their own words, in their proposal for the project, Faith Church refers to this project as a ministry. Not a word normally associated with that which is secular. It has been an insult, quite frankly, to the intelligence of many of us in West Lafayette that you have tried to sell Faith West as being secular and good for the economic development of our City. No matter how you try to spin this Faith West is not a secular 501(c)3 and the use of, the secular intentions of the use of the building funded and financed by EDRB's is questionable at best, as is the economic development benefit to the entire community. Though I am here sadly tonight, to send a message to the Mayor and the City Council, and I'm sorry to say also to Faith Church, the financing of this project with bonds issued by the City of West Lafayette does not meet the unanimous approval of the tax-paying, voting residents of the City. The neighbors may love it but there are others of us in this community that are not in favor of this type of financing for a 501(c)3 that is not secular. I am regretting that we have to bring this controversial issue before this wonderful community. Thank you for your time."

Al Parker (1015 Lindberg Road) said, "I live right across the street from this project. I have lived there long enough to see the wonderful project of Family Inn come and go. I am here to speak for the project tonight, and this is why. This is a project that did not start out from outside developers coming in to make a quick buck in our town. This is a project

that was originally started and come back to immediately, to the neighborhood. When they looked at this project, their first concern was, 'What can we do to improve the neighborhood?' And they brought us neighbors together, many of which have a very diverse background. We come from all walks of life, all different ages. We have neighbors living right adjacent to this property that have been living there 20, 30, 40, 50 years. We are very well established. We have our own views. I, for one, am an elder in my own church. I have never even considered going to any of the religious services that may be held here and I can pretty much tell you that most of my neighbors feel the same way. We have our own beliefs where they are. We judge this project on what they're bringing and what they're willing to bring to the neighborhood. And as much as all of us love that wonderful fenced in blank field, mosquito-infested dirt bag of a lot, when you take a look at what they're offering here, it started with asking the neighbors, 'What will improve your quality of life?' And that's how this project developed. I believe, although the tax base hasn't been settled uh finalized yet, I believe it will help our tax base. This certainly is a blighted area and this building will improve it. It will improve the quality of life of many in the community by what they offer, not even considering the faith side of it. I will say this, if those of us who live in the neighborhood have talked to them at great length to help them build it and design it, if all of us that are there from all walks of life and different beliefs, if we don't fear it, than neither should anybody else. We'd ask that you would take a proverbial leap forward in faith. Take a look at the project and vote yes. Thank you."

Stan Alexander (705 North Chauncey) stated, "I ask that the Council take a leap of second thought. I think there's some arguments that haven't been made and I respect the research that's been done, and I'm sure the legal work that was done by Faith and the City in examining this issue, but there's some facts that I have not seen presented and I'd like to see them presented. One concerns what kind of income would we be getting from that property if it were a commercial tax-paying entity? What are other properties in West Lafayette paying of a similar size, that we're going to be losing the revenue from? I know there's no one pounding on our doors and you've made that clear and I know it's difficult to wait, but we're losing revenue potentially and what amount would that be? I haven't heard that yet and I'd like to hear that argument. The other area I'm concerned about, I was involved about five years ago when Faith applied for bonds in front of the County Council. We had a coalition of mostly business owners, owners of fitness centers primarily and I asked them to speak at your pre-community meeting on Thursday. I've been out of town and I don't know if the individual had. Both of the individuals concerned about the project on the east side of town have gone out of business. Now again, I'm not saying it's a church fitness center that put them out of business necessarily, but it is striking that those two individuals were concerned enough. One owned a tennis club that now is an eyesore. It's vacant on the other side of town, and the other owned a fitness center that he has now sold to another company because he couldn't make a financial go of it on the east side of town. What about the preschools and the day care centers? What's their margin of revenue? Can they make a go of it if they don't have the revenue abatement that a bond will allow for this church project? Many daycare centers in this community, they operate on a very tight budget. Rent is big. So if there is a daycare center that's not having to pay the same type of rent, how many of those daycare centers will be here in a year or two years? Have we created an unfair business advantage for some of the fitness clubs and daycare centers that we want to see thrive in this community? Thank you for your time."

John Haughee (121 Tomahawk Lane) said, "I want to tell you, I'm 85 years old. I'm out of shape up here. On September 17, the Constitution of Convention presented to the States

the Constitution. The Preamble states all the purposes of the document. A man by the name of Wilson stated he wanted to place three words to the beginning of the document. They argued with him for a while, but they were placed in bold letters, and they were: 'We, the People'. The amendments were put in as safeguardants for the people. That's basically the first ten. I want to read that first amendment. That's uno, one, so it must be important. 'Congress shall make no law respecting or establishing a religion or prohibiting the free exercise thereof.' Therefore, Congress says they cannot help that church. Congress makes the laws. They're designated to make the laws, and they have no disregard for that. They are not in opposition for the church to build that complex. They certainly can. I think they could. I think they're capable. I believe it would be a great project. But, this document says, 'Congress shall make no law respecting an establishment of religion.' The amendments were put in. Jonathon Jennings, 25 years old, in 1816, hard work travelling to the cities and towns of Indiana, saw to it that slavery was never to be allowed, nor involuntary servitude be practiced in Indiana. Now Jonathon Jennings was down there in Vincennes Indiana and he was so thrilled that the State of Indiana was going to try to be admitted to the Union, and then he was so discouraged because he saw that, and I'm sorry to say this, that great general, William Henry Harrison, was actually for slavery to be put in the document. And so Jonathon Jennings, and that's why I'm here. Because I didn't want to come down here, but when I read that about Jonathon Jennings who fought to keep slavery out of that Constitution, I said to myself, 'Hey, I'm going down there and give them my opinions.' Because he was successful. He went all over the State of Indiana. He rode a horse all across the state. Vincennes and those areas were for slavery and they had it all wrapped up, but Jonathon Jennings, just one person, made enough talks to others, and for that reason slavery was not permitted. And he fought it hard, and he said, "And also, not even involuntary servitude will be practiced." It's in the document. Now, who makes the laws? Well, Congress makes the laws. In 1816 the State of Indiana was admitted and from that the State of Indiana and all of those officials in the State of Indiana swore an oath to uphold the Constitution of the United States, and so therefore, if Congress cannot make a law concerning religion, neither can a city in the State of Indiana. I say to you, that I'm not opposed. I wish they would build it. I wish that they would build that, but I must say, you cannot issue those bonds and say to yourself - Didn't you take that oath? Didn't you take the oath? I'm sure you did. You swore, when you took this position, you swore to uphold, to defend, to support that Constitution. In 1944 folks, I volunteered for the US Navy. And I'll never forget when that commander asked us that we were going out on the sea, so that they will not come here. And I still knew that one of the words were that you will support, you're going out there to protect the US Constitution, and if you raised your hand to become Mayor and if you raised your hand to become a Council member.....of course you would like to see the City grow well and help these people that want to do good. Of course we would. But if you took the oath, 'Congress shall make no law respecting an establishment of religion and or prohibiting the free exercise thereof.' So we are not going to try to stop the church but we cannot make a law to issue bonds to promote that endeavor, as good as it is. I address this Council and I thank you very much for your attention and I end by saying I have no ill will to this church or any other but no church with this document, I don't see how it can. 'Congress shall make no law.' And the laws that were sent to Indiana by the Congress who is entitled only to make laws. Congress makes the law. You in this group make the law for the City, but you cannot make a law from this book. Thank you very much. Excuse me your honor, your Excellency, Mr. Mayor, my mind failed me. I too am a graduate of Indiana State!"

Mayor Dennis responded, "Rock on, Sycamore!"

Matt Scott (1208 North Grant Street) said, "My wife and I live across the street here and I want to thank everyone for coming on over here to the neighborhood this evening. We have been working in international outreach for the past eight years here at Purdue and the West Lafayette area. And you might wonder what international outreach has to do with economic development. I think that, Peter, you really pointed out well there are a lot of side issues that come into play when you talk about a project like this. And one of those side issues is the international outreach being done on the campus at any given time. Every year, thousands of the best, brightest people in the world show up at Purdue University. It's just a wonderful opportunity. It's how America was built. It's how America was made great. Our forefathers, our ancestors, they all showed up the same way. We want to keep these people. We want to keep as many of them as we can. It will greatly help the economic development of West Lafayette and make it the kind of city that people will want to live in. I had the great opportunity a few weeks ago to sit down with Joe Potts. Dr. Potts is the new Director for International Programs at Purdue University. In the meeting, he pointed out that the community outreach groups are instrumental. They are the backbone of welcoming and integrating international students to West Lafayette and Purdue University. Without these community groups, he said Purdue could not bring the international students that they have here. But then he went on to say that there is a great need for more help, because as we've all noticed, there are thousands more international students coming. It is the goal of the University to bring these folks here. So what are we going to do with them? And so he was asking for more help. And that's where projects like Faith West are so important. We already have a committee of five Americans and eight internationals, from West Lafayette, and living in West Lafayette, figuring out how we are going to use this center to engage and reach out to international students. How we can make them feel better at home. Until you are in international ministry, you don't realize how difficult it is for these students. I mean, we have a lot of fun. We go to Chicago, we go to Cincinnati, we go to the Tippecanoe Mall, we go to Wal-Mart. It's all, you know, a good time, but at the same time, we get a lot of calls. We get homeless students. We get suicidal students. We get depressed students ready to drop out of school because they haven't been able to accommodate to our culture. And that's a huge thing. And there's a lot of resources that Faith has to bear, to bring to bear on this need. And so I'm asking the City Council if you would please approve this economic development bond to help Faith move forward with this project, so that we can start reaching out more to these international students, because they can be, if handled properly in this whole need situation, they can be a great part of the future of West Lafayette. Thank you."

Mario Melendez (435 West State Street) stated, "It is great to see Matt, my colleague of campus ministries, speaking here. It is a pleasure and privilege to come here tonight and join my fellow residents here of the City of West Lafayette talk about this issue. I'll do my best to be quick and concise as I speak about this one proposal. Looking at just a few of the arguments and counter-arguments of this proposal. First of all, the point has been made clear, and I think Matt spoke with it with passion. The issue isn't with the project itself. The issue is with the bond proposal. There are definitely some benefits that have been pointed out with this project. But it is not about Faith Church. It is right to have a campus ministry. It is right to have a seminary. To have the things that it needs to be a place for ministry to the Purdue community. None of us go into this for the money. If you think you make money at campus ministry you better look somewhere else. So, it's not that. It's not that at all. It is about the bond proposal itself, and that's where the issue is. Todd Ponder, the lawyer for the law firm, Ice Miller, spoke about the more than 140

projects of religious organizations like Faith Church that have used these type of bonds for construction like Faith West. This argument, in itself, is problematic. This is not about Faith Church. This is not about them being a religious organization and their right to build this project. This is not about that at all. It's not the issue. It's about the bond proposal. How many of those 140 projects have been in the City of West Lafayette with these bonds? Only one and that is the Westminster senior community living house, which is very important of course. It was not used to build a facility for a campus ministry, or a seminary, or a biblical counseling center. Your argument is that Pastor Viars has said of the 20 years it will take Faith Church to repay these bonds, they estimate it will save Faith Church about \$577,000 in interest when compared with financing from the open market with a higher interest rate. This was, of course, I understand, they saw the opportunity and they went for it. That in itself is not wrong. You have the right, absolutely. But, if they have the borrowing power, and they say they do and I believe that they say they do, they can do this on the open market. They can do this themselves. So this is not being against the project itself. And this is not, like my colleague Matt, here, of Campus Ministry, he wants the project. It's not about that. It is about the bond proposal. So, for those of us in campus ministry, we welcome this, we wish you the best, but I ask the City, City Council Members, this is about you're not voting here tonight about the merits of the project itself, you are simply voting on the bond proposal. And I ask you to please, I say this with love, but please vote against it. Thank you."

Nathan Conrad (2108 North Salisbury Street) said "I'll be quick. I come here both as a Purdue University student and as a home owner of this community, living half a mile away from the proposed site. I think that we need to decide whether this meets the two criteria for the bond proposal. Is it a net benefit for the community and does it have an economic impact? One of the economic impacts which has been mentioned is the property values of the surrounding homes, and as I recently purchased my home I have a, somewhat of an idea of that sort of thing right now. So, when I was looking for a home, I was definitely looking for something that would make the community pedestrian friendly, bicycle friendly. I want retail sites close by to me. As, I guess, and this is what we see younger people do, that we want to bring to our community, and we want to stay here. Adding a retail establishment, maybe a grocery store, shops, to me would be a much better use of this land, be of much greater benefit to the community than adding this religious development. I also wanted to say that I agree with everything that, uh, Councilman Bunder said before the public have had the chance to speak. Thank you very much for your time."

Eythan Weg (132 Rockland Drive) said, "I'm for the project, really. However, I really ask myself when people speak about tax exemption, well, Faith would get tax exemption and that means some years we would not collect tax, right? So it means there would be less revenues for people who expect those revenues. And when those expectations are not met, there will be ideas of raising taxes and do we taxes in two or three or five years to be raised, partially because today we are going to approve this tax exemption for Faith? No new taxes, please. Not now, and not in the next five years, perhaps. Thank you."

Rod Zambrows (2820 Ashland Street) said, "Sadly, I probably have nothing new to say to the Council but thank you for letting me be here anyway. Perhaps I could say something to everybody and Pastor Viars. I am sure you are aware of the Hebrew scriptures where the first judges in Exodus were tasked to solve problems by bringing rumination and reconciliation so that all parties went home satisfied. Based on the letters in our local paper, and the number of people here, it seems that this proposal to issue City bonds has become much more divisive than anyone dreamed. Yes, there are disagreements over

the boundaries of church and state, and human relations. I do question whether Faith Baptist would ever have a woman Senior Pastor, a GLBTQ person on staff or on their board, a sexually active unmarried adult in the same. These are just some questions that I bring up. But this somehow, the bond issue, has become tied with a Faith versus them. And as many speakers have said, it's not about Faith building this project. It's about the appropriateness of a bond issue, issued to an organization that in the case narrative states, 'Every space in Faith West is designed to serve the purpose of Faith Church.' It seems clear that this is a religious establishment, and if the City chooses it, it's probably legal to do what you're asked to do, but sometimes because it's legal doesn't mean it's good, helpful, or even godly. At this point, the question has never been whether or not to build the project. It's about how to fund it. At this point, Faith is in the driver's seat. No one is forcing you to change your mission statement or reinterpret the Bible. No one on the Council is saying you can't build. You are in control. You have the power right now. You are in the driver's seat. And my question is how will you wield this power? Will Faith Church be good neighbors, or will the new kid on the block be a bully – polarizing, divisive and adversarial. How would Faith benefit, or how does Faith benefit by pushing Council members, or any of us, into a no-win scenario, where we're forced to choose between upholding the municipal statutes and guidelines or endorsing an organization that can't due to their view of scripture. And again, I'm not asking them to change how they do things, but I'm asking you, is this something we should endorse? Given the current atmosphere, I can only imagine what the repercussions for you would be if you voted this down. I can't imagine what the repercussions would be for a local business or a neighboring church body that would dare to oppose this specific ordinance. If there are any repercussions, though, it would be very sad. Perhaps there is a way out, though. And I believe you, Pastor Viars, hold the key to this. You are in a position to send everyone home satisfied. This is clearly a divisive issue. Perhaps if Faith took the high road and withdrew the request for the vote, you would not be forced to vote. None of you would lose sleep over this anymore. You may not get the assistance from the church, from the City, but you could appeal to the County, and I'm sure the County would help you with what you asked for, without alienating your new neighbors. Thank you."

Sheila Rosenthal (2856 Ashland Street) said, "I've been a City resident for more than 20 years and I'd just like to make a couple brief points. The first one, about the economic development facet, and it has been stated before, but I hope when we get to that point, it has been adequately addressed, the other fitness centers and preschools that may or may not be affected by this, and are those jobs just going to be jobs that are taken away from other businesses locally? The other one is about the precedent of the Westminster. I think this is a different project, and that project being a senior citizen development housing and I don't think that saying that a precedent has already been set is really being accurate. I think this is really setting a new precedent and I'd just like to say that I believe that citizen input is very important, and I'm glad to have the opportunity and for others to have the opportunity to address our local officials. Thank you."

Brent Aucoin (320 North Brookfield Drive) said, "I have my master's degree in Aerospace Engineering from Purdue, I'm not anti-Science. I am also currently on staff at Faith. Some have raised the concern that a savings of \$577,000 is not terribly significant, which is the amount we would save over the 20 year history of the course of these bonds. Some, might even, the rumor has been going around, might even be the equivalent of Pastor Viars' salary, which is, by the way, not a true rumor."

Mayor Dennis interrupted and said, "Actually, it's the Mayor's salary."

Mr. Aucoin continued, "It's your salary."

Mayor Dennis asked, "Did you see Judy's face?"

Mr. Aucoin continued, "I know I'm in the wrong job, then. We understand that Faith, as a religious organization, and as a 501(c)3 organization, we are granted certain tax exempt benefits, privileges that for profit organizations are not granted. We also understand that our mission as a religious organization is indeed, can I say it, non-profit. We have the mission and the conviction that our resources are to be reinvested in strengthening the community in which we reside. We have demonstrated this consistently and repeatedly by our activities on the east side in various ways. It is true over the lifetime of these bonds, it will save Faith \$577,000. The community park that we are planning as part of Faith West is just one example of an investment that offsets the tax exempt bond savings. Between the cost of the land, the walking trail, the playground, and the maintenance, Faith will invest over \$600,000 of its own members' money into the community through that community park, which is available to anyone. Furthermore, that community park will not cost the taxpayers one cent. So, some have raised the concern that the \$577,00 is not terribly significant, yet based upon our mission and our convictions, we strive to be a good steward of every dollar so that the resources will be reinvested wisely in strengthening the community in which we live, in which we live. Thank you Councilors for your consideration of Faith West as a benefit to the community."

Michael King (1100 Kingswood Road South) said, "Mr. Mayor, Council Members, I am the owner and CEO of Trinitas Ventures, a real estate development, construction and management company headquartered here. We operate student housing projects in five states, and multiple project throughout Indiana, and operate 1,000 beds locally. We have been asked the question how Faith West's tax exempt bond financing and possible tax exempt property tax situation would affect our company from a competitive leasing standpoint. The answer is simple. The market has adjusted a long time ago for this type of product. We currently compete well with all of Purdue University's tax free housing, as well as other not for profit organizations, such as fraternities, sororities, co-ops, and low-income government housing like Richfield and Beau Jardin apartments. What is good for our company competitively is a great university and an economically growing community. Faith West's project will improve the West Lafayette community. I ask the Council to vote to approve this bond issue. Thank you."

Dave Boudia (2018 McCormick Road) said, "I'm a student athlete at Purdue for the past there years and I would just like to take this opportunity to give a student's perspective on the Faith West's housing. I know that college is a trying time for students and the environment in which they live in is crucial for their development. Many decisions will be made that will have a positive or negative influence on their lives while they're here living in West Lafayette. The housing at Faith West will just provide students who desire to live there the opportunity to grow as individuals and help promote a positive environment in which they are able to seek wisdom and they are able to handle life's tough situations with discernment. They'll help equip and focus specifics on the students' character which will send them off into the real world with integrity. I believe that this housing project, specifically, will provide West Lafayette and the community a significant benefit for a brighter future and I believe that as a new homeowner in West Lafayette it provides a benefit for other students to reside here. Thanks."

Michael Brownstein (2101 Cumberland Avenue, #8207) said, "I am part of the fourth district and I'd like to speak to the Council in opposition to this project. Most of the individuals who have come up today have spoken about how the project will help the community. I'd like to ask which community that will be? It seems that most of these slideshows are showing that it's self-fulfilling to their communities. I'd like to mention that because they are tax exempt, and there is a lot of construction near their lot, that they will not pay a dime of anything for those roads. The construction that will probably likely happen again to repair the roads will not be paid, a dime will not be paid by Faith West, and if they were a real steward of the community, I would ask that they go through a private sector and contribute like all the rest of us taxpayers. Thank you."

Vidhya Iyer (3408 Putnam Street) said, "But I am one of the members of the Human Relations Commission. Our Chair, who met with the Mayor on Friday, was not able to be here. But I'm reading a statement from the Commission. Mayor Dennis, below is a statement from the West Lafayette Human Relations Commission concerning the Faith West Community Center. The statement reflects the comments of David Rosenthal and, I'm quoting, Charlie Shook, our Chair, made when we met on Friday. Since the meeting we've had conversations with the Commission and the statement below reflects the Commission's position on the Center. This is Charlie Shook's statement, who is our Chair: 'Number one, we welcome Faith West Community Center to the West Lafayette Community. Number two, we are not in a position to determine whether Faith West is in a position for the economic development bonds, and if we were, to be properly educated to reach such a position, the advocacy or lack thereof of economic development bonds does not fall within the purview of the Human Relations Commission's, mission, so we really don't want to comment on the economic part of it. Third, as with any business operating within the City of West Lafayette, we fully expect that the Faith West Community Center will comply with all the applicable laws, including Section 24 of the City Code, and the related Human Relations resolutions and its amendments and will adhere to the well established principles of our City, including doing its part to ensure that West Lafayette remains a fair and inclusive community.' I just wanted to quote what the Section 24 says very quickly. 'Section 24: This article is designed to prevent prejudice, intolerance, bigotry, disorder, and discrimination. The City will increase its attempt to bring about mutual respect, understanding of each other in all groups, and help guarantee equal rights to all citizens as affected, as afforded, by the code and other ordinances of the City.' 'So,' and I quote, 'this is our position in the Human Relations Commission.'

Mayor Dennis responded, "Mine too."

Bryan Coulter (759 Essex Street) said, "I believe that if the church is going to be in compliance with the Human Relations Commission they should forfeit their exemption so that we know that tomorrow, and next year, and five years, and ten years from now they will also be in compliance with the Human Relations Commission. There's nothing stopping them from changing tomorrow, and we won't be having a meeting like this. I am here asking the Council to vote in opposition and vote no. And it's not because of their beliefs. I think it's unfortunate that their lawyer remarked that if we are in opposition it must be because we are biased against the church or biased against Christians. I don't believe that is true at all. It is a fundamental disagreement about the separation of church and state. It has nothing to do with the church itself and certainly not Baptists. I wanted to read to you, just briefly, the description of Faith West's own Facebook page of Faith West. They will have a worship space, but they will also have multi-purpose recreation, fitness center, child care area, gathering area, lounge area, study area, retail, food service

area, and housing. And the reason I ask you to vote no is because I, my understanding is they will not pay property taxes like any other child care facility, or retail facility, or daycare facility, or your food service facility. I think that's wrong. It is a subsidy, that everyone will be subsidizing the money that they are not paying in property taxes, along with the \$56,000 per year they will be getting in interest they will not be paying. And I do wonder what it will be like when a gay person, or lesbian person, bisexual person, transsexual person goes into the Faith West Baptist Community Center, or retail establishment, or eats dinner, or holds hands. They will be exempt from the Human Relations Commission and I think for this reason we should remain separate from the church and vote no."

Dr. Mark Dutton (652 Shady Creek Drive) said, "I'm one of the pastors at Faith Church and one of my responsibilities is organizing conferences. And for over 25 years Faith Church has hosted a February counseling training conference. Just this past year, 2012, this event attracted 1,720 people from more than 40 states and 10 foreign countries. We asked Joe Wade, of the West Lafayette and Lafayette Convention and Visitors Bureau, to help us determine the economic impact of that event. The result was this: \$1.6 million dollars of economic activity occurred as a result of that conference. Based on the number of people who stayed in hotels, the number of people hosted by members of our church, they went to restaurants, gas stations, drug stores, shopping centers, all places people will normally go when they stay in a community for nearly a week. So when you include the other conferences, the number rises to close to \$2 million dollars that the Visitor Bureau estimates our conference guests spend annually in this community. Here's our point: In addition to the construction jobs, the permanent jobs, and the normal economic activity, Faith West's economic impact includes conferences we bring to this community each year. These events will provide, these events will provide an additional economic boost to the West Lafayette economy, therefore we would encourage you to vote yes. Thank you."

Frank Rosenthal (2856 Ashland Street) said, "I lived in West Lafayette about 22 years and I want to urge the Council Members to vote no on this resolution. And I like the phrase that was used by one of the previous speakers, and I don't remember who it was, but who said something about common sense separation of church and state, and I think that's what we need to think about, not what this court, or what that court is going to decide. I think from a common sense, I don't think this proposal, and again, we're talking about the bond proposal, we're not talking about the project, itself. I don't think this proposal satisfies the common sense separation of church and state. And I think that the two basic reasons are, first of all, it is a religious center. It will have some community service aspects to it, but its primary purpose is as a religious center. As a matter of fact, from the fund raising drive, Faith West states, 'Our project is a new student and Biblical counseling center, close to Purdue University, which we are calling Faith West. Our funding support goal is to assist purchasing land, site development and construction of the Purdue Bible Fellowship and Biblical counseling facility.' So its primary purpose is religious and I think approving the bond issue is a form of endorsement. It's not a financial contribution to the project, but is materially assisting the project and I don't think that's appropriate for our government to do. I think we can be very proud that we live in a community where the vast majority of people respect diversity in religious beliefs and I believe that to preserve that commitment and respect it's important that we observe this common sense separation of church and state.

Liz Wallace (1413 North 15<sup>th</sup> Street) said, "I am the Development Director of the Red Cross here in Tippecanoe County and I am here to speak on our chapter's behalf, in

support of the Faith Community Center in West Lafayette. Faith has already agreed that this community center will be an emergency shelter for the American Red Cross. What this means is that, in the event of a large scale disaster such as the Pine Manor Apartment fire that happened two years ago, which displaced 30 community members that had nowhere else to go, we would be able to call Faith anytime, day or night, and they would open up a shelter on our behalf, so that we could immediately shelter them and then focus on their other needs; food, clothing, medical supplies, and mental health counseling, if needed. And, since we've partnered with them since the beginning of this build, we've put in a request for a generator hook-up. Provided that the Red Cross finds funding for an emergency generator, this will be the only Red Cross shelter in the Greater Lafayette area that has generator capabilities, which will be vital in the case of a disaster that knocks out power to the community, and we have to open our shelter in that scenario. They've also agreed to let the American Red Cross host community education classes free of charge to us. This means we will have a more convenient location to West Lafayette citizens to provide CPR, First Aid, ED training, and provide our disaster training classes, which are free to the community. Anyone wanting to learn more on how to be prepared in emergencies and disasters can sign up for these classes at Faith West as well as Faith East in Lafayette. Our partnership with Faith means that when SIA approached us to build a house for our disaster clients and we couldn't accept, Faith offered the land and the headache of homeownership, while still allowing the Red Cross to use this house for our disaster clients. We're going to start that campaign this fall, with ground being broken sometime next year. And finally they are one of our largest supporters of our Christmas for Everyone program. We are the largest Christmas gift assistance program in the community, providing gifts for low-income children, and it is only because of our partnership with Faith and its partner churches and parishioners that we are able to provide gifts for over 2,000 children on a yearly basis. And it's for all these reasons and many, many more that the American Red Cross fully supports the Faith West Community Center Project in West Lafayette. Thank you."

Mayor Dennis asked the Council if they wanted to keep going through until everyone speaks.

Councilor VanBogaert encouraged everyone to get up and get in line if they want to speak and said he wanted to hear everyone.

Councilor Hunt said she did, too. She said she found the applause agitating and thinks it is extending the meeting and asked to do without it.

Mayor Dennis said there would be no more clapping.

Candace Dunston (1833 Mallard Court) said, "I would like to speak from the perspective of a mom about what I see as the net benefit of Faith West. When I looked at Faith West's site plan and saw the neighborhood drawn in, I was elated. The general welfare of our neighborhood will be richly and warmly enhanced, I believe, by a playground in our community. Children love playgrounds and caregivers and parents congregate on those grounds while the kids play. We talk to each other. We get to know one another. We get to know each others' kids and then as I see these parents and kids in the neighborhood, they're not just strangers, but my neighbors. And that causes me to care about them in a different way. I don't know why, but at the park, talking seems easier, more natural, safer. It builds connection, togetherness and more unity and that promotes the general well being of any community. What a delight to have our own neighborhood park. Many residents drive several miles out of their way to find what they consider to be good childcare. And many of them drive to the east. I've heard nothing but good things about

the childcare offered at Faith on the east side. How exciting again, that that premium childcare will be available in our neck of the woods, and we wouldn't have to drive 20 to 30 minutes to get it. If I pick up my children on the east side, I usually treat them on the east side. If I pick up my children on the west, I will treat them here. I believe in the community. We gain so much more than we're being asked to give. Please consider their request. Thank you for your time."

Paul Addison (2009 Carlisle Road) said, "I live directly behind the property in question. I wasn't going to come up because you've seen me at every City Council meeting, Area Plan Commission meeting, Economic Development Commission meeting, and most of the arguments that I've heard tonight are the same things over and over, but a couple things keep coming up that I just felt that I had to address. One of them is insinuation that this is a religious institution, a religious community center, just because it's owned by a church. The dormitory where the residents have to sign an agreement not to use alcohol, drugs, and live a chaste lifestyle, I don't think that discriminates against anybody except ones that don't use a chaste lifestyle, and use alcohol and drugs. It doesn't discriminate against a particular group, and it definitely does not make that a religious community center. The second thing is, someone asked, 'Would they be a good neighbor?', you know, 'Would they turn around and be a bully?' I can see no way that that would happen. Faith came to us first. They asked us what we wanted in the community center, we told them. They've developed the plans accordingly, and I think that everyone in the neighborhood that I've talked to already considers Faith West a good neighbor. Whether the bond issue goes through or not, I think the projects going to be built and the neighborhood where it's going to be built is solidly behind it. Thank you."

Reann Weber (5652 Mercy Way) said, "I am a current resident of Vision of Hope Residential Treatment Center on Faith Campus. I am here tonight to tell you how being involved with Faith has been life-changing for me, and how amazing it would be to continue these good changes by living at Faith West while going to Purdue University. I am so excited about the help that I have gotten, and for my future. I plan to keep growing and utilizing the resources around me to help me make better decisions. Because of my history with drugs and alcohol, being able to live at Faith West where I would be held accountable, and live in a drug, alcohol, and sex-free environment would allow me to gain the knowledge, through Faith ministries, to one day support myself. Being able to live at Faith West would also allow me to give back what has been given to me. It would give me the opportunity to serve others on campus and provide a way to show others in the community that real change is possible. Beginning at age 13, I was in and out of the justice system. At age 18, I became a convicted drug felon, and was sent to Rockville Correctional Facility, in other words, a maximum security prison. I cost my community over \$29,000 in court costs, lawyer fees, failed drug tests, and my housing in the prison system. I spent my 19<sup>th</sup> birthday there. Then I came to Vision of Hope on early release. Through the Biblical counseling I have received at Faith, I have learned that I am not alone in this struggle, and there are real answers to my problems. I'm excited to give back to my community and what I have taken from them through my drug and alcohol addiction. And I believe that an education at Purdue and a safe living environment at Faith West will help me make that possible."

James Woten (3051 Chapelgate Way, Apt M) said, "I would like to show my support, primarily as an example, not in the form of bonds and such things. I am 33 years old. I was diagnosed with a psychiatric disorder after two years in college, and I spent ten years, smoking and sleeping. And I kind of accidentally found Faith Church, um, when I'd

come to visit here with my sister. Anyway, long story short, I got involved in the Biblical counseling program and I can't emphasize enough how important it is, how like aside from all the money, all the profits, or whatever. The real profit is going to be in the changing of lives. The students that are going to come to the counseling center. Myself, after being a slave to my own diagnosis for approximately 12, 13 years, I can safely say now that I'm going back to college. I graduated valedictorian of my original high school. Doesn't mean anything now. But I'm going to go ahead. I'm going to do college again. I'm employed full time at the largest food chain in the country, and, I can't thank Faith enough for that. I hate to pull on you guys heartstrings too much, but that's all I have to say. Thank you."

Jim Bethel (508 Parkridge Drive) said, "I lived there for 23 years, and I speak in opposition to the approval of this bond issue. I don't think, I don't see why the City is even considering getting involved in financing this religious project. It violates in spirit, if not in letter, the separation of church and state. I think they should finance it on their own. Please vote no. Thank you."

Joyce Deutelbaum (1000 Eton Street) said "We've heard many, many benefits tonight, that this project will bring to West Lafayette, and I think many of us here who are voicing our concerns are not in opposition to the project at all. What we are concerned about is the funding with the tax exempt bonds. And I would like to say that my opposition is really that I question whether it is a needed or fair use of the economic development bonds. I'm especially concerned about the City enabling unfair competition. Giving Faith lower rate bonds gives them an advantage in reduced costs. This helps them offer services at rates below nearby fitness and daycare centers. I, myself, use International Sports Fitness Center, especially the pool for physical therapy, and I would not want to see that business put at risk by unfair competition made possible with the City's help. Yet West Lafayette would be doing just exactly that at a time when borrowing money is at or near all time lows. Using the figures provided in Sunday's *Journal and Courier*, actually the 20 year bond would save Faith the \$577,000 over 20 years, but that's just \$29,000 a year, if you do the math, and the pastor was quoted as saying, 'We could have done a \$20 million project.' So clearly Faith can afford the extra interest. So my feeling is that Faith should build the project. It will bring many pluses to the community, but our help is not needed. And we're giving it an unfair advantage for the City to do so. Thank you."

Bill Baitinger (700 Sugar Hill Drive) said "I live in Wabash Township, which I think claims precedence over West Lafayette, I wanted to point that out. I'd also like to thank, , I hadn't planned to speak at all, so this is all extemporaneous here, I'd like to thank everybody who's here today, because I'm sure they're involved in the 300 plus emails I received as Chairman of the Economic Development Commission for West Lafayette. I don't want to belabor the same points that people have had. You've already heard quite a few of those. One additional point I would point out which I had some trouble with, and that is we're saying here, that you can use economic development bonds for any 501(c)3, whether you like the group or don't like the group, or what they actually stand for. That sets a precedent, in my mind, for going beyond what we've traditionally used economic development bonds in the past. I had a conversation with Reverend Viars. What he points out is this is actually a new model for economic development. So you may want to consider that. It's one I haven't quite decided on. So that was just something I'd point out to the group. And the other thing which really impressed me this evening is that only in American can you have a meeting like this. And when we're all done here and we go home, I think what you need to do is, we all have to live together, so you can forget about

your pros and cons on this. We will reach a decision tonight which I'm sure this group will do, and we'll go on from there. So remember, only in America can we do this."

Adam Murphy (3517 South 9<sup>th</sup> Street) said, "I supervise the supportive housing programs, through the City of Lafayette, that helps folks that are chronically homeless, that also have a mental illness, a substance abuse problem, or HIV AIDS. I also have a program that helps folks that have just come back from prison, reenter the community with housing, as well as another program that helps folks that are domestic violence victims, the women and their families. And I believe there's three reasons why this, proposal should be considered. The first is that West Lafayette is going to gain a valuable community partner. I can only speak from experience here, what we've experienced in our own programs. First of all, we have a lot of folks who come through with very specific needs. For example, a family, a mother of three kids comes through and she has no clothes for the school, for school tomorrow, and all I have to do is, uh, pick up the phone, and this actually happened, and it's not the scheduled night, but is there anyone there at the community center that can open up the clothing closet so the kids can go to school with more than just what they're wearing at the moment? And the staff is enthusiastically willing to do that. A number of persons I work with cannot get food stamps because of felonies, because of things that they've done previously. And so the food pantry is a valuable resource for us, and at no time have I, am I ever asked, 'Now what specific offense did this person commit?' or 'Why exactly are they walking through here trying to get food?' It's 'How much food do you need?' or 'What more can we do?' It's arms wide open. We have mothers, a mother with five kids, a sixth on the way within 30 days, and I've moved her into a new apartment. She's trying to escape a domestic violence situation. Five kids, another on the way. She's got so many irons in the fire. I asked Faith, 'Is there just someone that could meet with her, and help her to work through the school issues, work through just logistics, get meals planned?' They sent someone right away that communicates with us regularly so that we could meet her needs. At no time asked, 'What is her particular situation?' Just, 'How can we help?' I think of three children, and their mother that walked hand in hand in the zero entry pool, because they had never really been in the water long enough to gain acclamation to it. They were really scared of it, and with a volunteer that came walking into the water until it came up to chest level. She wanted her kids to know that you shouldn't be afraid of water, because she knew that when kids are afraid of water and they get in a dangerous situation, they are more likely to drown. And that's made possible because of Faith East. And then I think about the chronically homeless man that I came across that had an oxygen tank, that was not allowed to go to the homeless shelter. I called up the community center director. I said, 'Look, he's gotta go somewhere tonight, cause I've got an apartment for him tomorrow, but he will either get sick or worse out there in the community until he's in an apartment. The community center director allowed him to come in and stayed with him to make sure he'd be O.K. That's the kind of partner that wants to come to West Lafayette, and I'm envious. I'm envious that you have this kind of resource coming to your community. The other two points which are shorter - Faith Church has proven to be a respectful acknowledger of differences, but respectful of differences, understanding of boundaries in everyone that we've sent their way. Again I mention the questions they are frequently asked, 'Is there anything else you need?' How else can we serve?' We have found them to be inclusive, not exclusive. We have found them to be willing, not hesitant. We have found them to be collaborative, not isolative. You need a partner like that! Well, why does West Lafayette need a partner like that? That's my third point. It's tempting to think with things going so well here, as a community, just so many bright points. Yet there are some that still need these kind of services. The Faith West site is within a mile of

three affordable housing developments, and a fourth, just down the road. 75 additional families are under Section 8 Housing out there in the community. One in eight school children receive a free or reduced lunch, and those folks that require the most help are the least likely to ask for it, which is why I think that the community center model is what you need to reach out to people who aren't used to getting services. It's, 'Hey, I came for coffee.' It's, 'Hey, I came to utilize the, uh, exercise equipment, or the park, but you know what I really need is someone to listen. I need some help. I need someone to help me get to the next step.' And Faith is always calling, referring folks, 'Look, we don't know what to do. Do you have any ideas?' And we need that kind of a partner. Economic development is community development. We understand that when we help the lower rung of the community we actually raise the standard of living in the community. And what I would urge the Council to consider is meeting this partner halfway, because they will bring much more, than some of the negative statements that have been made on the other side of the ledger. They bring so much more than just economic development. Thanks."

Catherine Grossman (705 North Chauncey Street) said, "While I've been listening to all the comments, excuse me, Mayor Dennis, Councilman Hunt, and Councilman Thomas, as the At Large Councilman on this, I've tried to reach you and hear some of your thoughts, because this is an opportunity for us to talk, but we don't really get to know what you think, and why you think as you do. As I'm listening to all the comments, especially those that talk about all the money that will be coming into the community and the benefits that Faith does, I'm salivating. I want them in the community too. And I like the comment, in particular, of the person that actually talked to you, Reverend Viars, about how you have some control here. This is substantially different from six years ago. I remember that, because I was concerned about first amendment rights as we've heard. I was concerned back then. There were eight people in the room. Oh my God, this is West Lafayette. This is very different. I'm very proud of our community. For coming out and caring enough to be a part of democracy in office. OK. All that. But it is a very different situation. Look at us. Look at us. What time is it now? And so I wanted to point that out. Times have changed, the issues have been eloquently explained, and this is West Lafayette. This isn't the County or Lafayette. We're a special community. I'm not going to repeat some of the things that I've heard, but I appreciate the eloquence of people who spoke before me. I want to bring one point that hasn't been mentioned, and that is that we have probably about 8 hands of government, or 16 hands of government. But I know that the community is working on a plan with the help of a consultant in Wisconsin, to help our City. Why did the Chamber initiate that, I ask? Why did the Chamber want the study? Something - business as usual, somehow isn't working. Business must be worried. And I think that, did anyone ask our consultant. That's another question I had. Did anyone think to consult with our consultant? To ask her, how would they advise us? We're an unusual City. We're small, but we have a national reputation, Japan, and you know, people all over. So I think that we have to treat this issue extremely delicately. I would ask that the Council entertain, maybe a postponement of the vote? The community is upset, and I don't think that while things go away, we also know how proven psychology works. Things don't really go away. They go down inside us. And I'm concerned about that. I think we can do a win-win. Mayor, you said a win-lose. But honestly there are win-wins. And I think this could be a win-win. I would love to see this project, that I know has the support of the community, and with all due respect to that community, I want them to have what they want. But, it's a divisive issue, as the gentleman so eloquently said when he brought in the Constitution of the United States which allows Faith its freedom. So, thank you."

Anna Biela, 3655 DeSoto Drive, said, "I'd like to thank the Council for continuously listening to me each time I have shown up at one of these meetings, and it's been an honor to meet with some of you and to talk to you and be a part of this. It was said at the Commission meeting that the only reason to vote against this ordinance was personal bias. This is a very narrow point of view, so I'd like to clearly explain five other reasons why you should vote against this ordinance. First, the way this is being handled is ethically questionable. The Mayor encouraged us to leave our disagreement and conflict at the door, yet Pastor Viars chose to misquote and vilify me at his Sunday service. And as I pointed out at the Commission meeting, the story we're being told is consistently inconsistent. We are promised that LGBT individuals will be welcomed, but I found a very interesting article, written by Pastor Viars, about how Michele Bachman is theologically bankrupt for saying that homosexual reparative therapy is a choice. From this I must extrapolate that what they mean is that LGBT people are welcome to be forced into this harmful and discredited therapy. Second, they tried to claim economic development in a saturated market. A significant portion of residents already have a free gym membership through Purdue. And there are significant other gyms and daycare centers throughout the City. So only people who would prefer Faith's facilities to those other facilities, are those who agree theologically, not those in the community at large. Third, 18 jobs that will go to their own seminary students is not economic stimulus. Especially considering that their salaries will go to paying their Faith tuition. The point was made that this helps business in Lafayette, but West Lafayette culture is much different. We are significantly more liberal, and if anything, such a conservative church would discourage businesses here. Fourth, this is not what economic development bonds were intended for. They are meant to encourage development that otherwise wouldn't occur. They have \$5 million on hand for this project, but \$500,000, or about four percent of their total budget, which is the estimated difference between whether they get the tax exempt bond, or just a simply a loan. Four percent of their total budget will not make or break this project. This isn't a question of whether or not it should be done but rather a question of whether or not the City should endorse it just to keep some cash in Faith's pockets. Fifth, the Council has the responsibility to respect Faith's choice as a religious institution, but it doesn't have to endorse their behavior or belief. This ties back to my first point about their views on LGBT members, about how their website promises they won't discriminate on race or ethnicity but they completely leave out gender, sexual orientation, all of these other things that are important to our community. So if you are uncomfortable with what they are doing, both in terms of how they are pursuing this or their treatment of non-heteronormative people, if you are not convinced that this is economic stimulus with the risk of lost tax revenue and the legal risks incurred, then you must vote no today. Thank you."

Caleb Dutton (652 Shady Creek Drive) said "I understand that as an eighteen year old I am way out of my league talking up here, so people that have been here, sitting here for two hours do not want to hear a dumb eighteen year old talk, so I'll keep it very brief. Two weeks ago, I walked across the stage with 45 of my best friends and graduated. Of those 45 kids, 5 of them have already declared and accepted to go to Purdue University, 10 of them have declared to go to Ivy Tech and transfer to Purdue University after a couple years of college. The reason I say this is because I know that my friends, a lot of my friends from high school, when provided with the wrong opportunities can go down the wrong road. Faith West provides a good opportunity for kids, coming out of high school to have good opportunity for accountability as well as room for housing and stuff like that. Another reason why I think that Faith West is going to be such a great addition to West Lafayette is because of, as has been mentioned earlier, things like the preschool, the activity center, the playground, and the facilities such as the gym. As a part of living over

in the east side of the community, I've also been given the opportunity to lead the coed camps for kids ages first grade through eighth grade in basketball. These kids are provided the opportunity to come and play basketball for four hours a day. It's not a great big deal. But what I've learned from doing this camp, is that kids do, like someone said earlier, just want attention. Faith West is definitely going to provide an opportunity for kids in the community to come and participate in activities like this. It's going to give opportunity for preschoolers to have someone to love and care for them, at all times, and their parents are going to know that they were left with great people. I would ask the Council to please approve of this and I look forward to seeing what happens in the community of West Lafayette."

Ashley Smith said, "Hi Y'all. I am the President of PRIDE Lafayette, Incorporated and the Chair of Outfest. Our mission is to promote the education and awareness of the LGBT community, and I've heard it mentioned several times here, and I had no intention, whatsoever of speaking, but when I heard Liz Wallace speak for the American Red Cross about how the American Red Cross could use Faith West, well my question to you Mister Viars would be, would you offer us the same space? Could we partner? Could we work together? We do educational programs all the time and we work with other churches, other non-profit organizations, and, I don't know, maybe a little education would be good on both sides. So I'd ask that maybe we partner?"

Sylvia Anderson (2526 Galema Drive) said, "Mayor, City Councilor, and all who are here, I rise to speak about one of the many ways that Faith Church is meeting the social needs of our community. Faith Church on the east side, currently is one of thirteen churches who partners with Greater Lafayette, Incorporated, a non-profit, 501(c)3, non-denominational organization serving homeless families in transition. Family Promise is one of 136 networks across the United States. Locally, Family Promise of Greater Lafayette collaborates with 13 churches to host these families free of charge. Faith Church serves by hosting up to 3 families, a total of 12 people, 3 weeks per year. Faith's involvement accomplishes several things. First, we assist the City with meeting the needs of homeless families, short-term and long-term. Secondly, we assist the community by developing assets in Family Promise families and connecting them regulatonally to long-term solutions. And finally, it lightens the burden of local social service providers, enabling them to put resources toward others in need. We pray to have Faith West available to assist in this collaborative outreach to Family Promise of Greater Lafayette, Incorporated. Thank you."

Gale Charlotte, 1124 Windsor Drive, said, "Good evening, I recently came before you to speak in favor of the Faith Church building project. No, I haven't changed my mind, just so you know. I am compelled to speak here tonight because a number of people, who know I live in the neighborhood, have asked me what I think about the request of Faith Church for tax exempt bonds. I really feel this issue has already been settled, at least in our local community, by the Tippecanoe County Council, who agreed a number of years ago to allow Faith Church to finance expansion at their east side location, in just this way. And there have been other entities in West Lafayette who have requested and received tax exempt bonds from the City of West Lafayette. There will be others in the future, who will come before this government entity, yes Muslim, Italian, you can fill in the blank, and I am sure you will give them the same consideration that you're giving to Faith Church. So why am I here tonight? Because I must, I feel I must speak in defense of Faith Church. This is really hard. This bond process has led to some passionate speeches. Some of my friends have spoken here tonight in the exact opposite of what I would speak,

including some remarks by a City Council Member. Mostly against allowing Faith Church to receive tax exempt bonds. I cannot speak for how the way people were treated in the past by Faith Church, nor can I speak about anything but my own experience with Pastor Viars and members of the Church. In case you don't know, I'm a woman, and I'm a lesbian. Evidently that gives me a unique qualification to speak, at least according to the City Council Member who spoke out against allowing Faith Church to receive the bonds, so I will. I have lived in this community for over 20 years so I have read guest columns written by Pastor Viars in the local newspaper. And I've also read quotes attributed to him. It's been clear to me that he's been against the homosexual lifestyle. His printed opinions on the subject have made me angry and they've made me sad. So when I heard Faith Church was considering a planned development, literally in my front yard, I was taken aback. Then, Faith Church contacted the neighbors and asked to meet with us. Well that was interesting. I didn't want to go. I didn't want to hear from someone who clearly didn't like me, without even knowing me. But then I remembered some lessons I learned from my religious upbringing. Number one, the golden rule, treat others as you would like to be treated. And then these words, attributed to Jesus: 'Turn the other cheek'. And my very own thoughts, that our children look to us to provide the example of how to treat other people. So I decided to go to hear what Pastor Viars and his congregation was planning, and to provide input, if asked. I'm glad I went. Because from the very first meeting, my partner and I were welcomed warmly. Pastor Viars and members of his committee listened to our ideas, answered our questions, and invited us back for the next meeting. Yes, you could say they needed our support, but really there were plenty of other neighbors they could use for that purpose. They didn't need us. We went back to the next meeting and the next. I never felt discriminated against, nor did I ever feel my opinions were discounted in any way. The committee listened to me, listened to my neighbors, and developed a great vision for the site. They said, over and over, that the neighbors would be welcome to use the facilities, and you know what? I believe them. In closing, I have to say, that in recent days I've seen some terrible things on the internet. American men purporting to be holy, who say that gays and lesbians should be thrown in concentration camps, should be killed. And then there were the men, right here in Indiana, who stood and cheered loudly when tiny kids sang 'homos don't get to go to heaven.' It's enough to turn any gay or lesbian against any kind of religion. But I'm taking a leap of faith, and I'm doing my part right here, right now, to build my section of the bridge of human understanding in our local community. If members of Faith Church decide to join me on this bridge, so much the better, because we might just set a good example for our children. I urge the Council to let the church have bonds to build the non-religious parts of the project. I believe they will use the money to make this community a better place."

Dr. John Houston (181 Ivy Hill Drive) said, "As I've listened, and as I've followed this in the press, before coming here tonight, what strikes me is you have a vote, to vote for the convenience of this church, or to vote for the conscientious objectors who are expressing their concerns about the separation of church and state based upon principles that directly address one's conscience. You see, they have the resources to build this. In fact one of their chief financial officers stood here tonight and said, 'Oh look! We spent over \$49,000 on t-shirts', O.K.? Over \$49,000 on t-shirts. This strikes me as a relatively frivolous expense. And over a course of 20 years they want to save this money. Now you can vote for the people here who are conscientiously objecting, and they will go on their way. The pastor has said they will get back together and they will meet and pray about this non-religious proposal that they have set up, and then they'll decide which way that God is leading them, so you will not be an impediment to - And I know, Mayor, you are clearly in

favor of this, and that's fine. And in fact I don't mind it being there either, but at what cost? At the cost of the conscience of certain people who have come here in good faith to say, in good faith, pardon the pun, that we don't approve of this. We have serious conscientious concerns. The older gentleman here, he reiterated them a number of times to us, but maybe we needed them to be reiterated. These issues of the separation of church and state come down to that. So you can vote for the convenience of them to save a buck. They've got the money. They've told us. In fact, in almost a bragging fashion, they've told us they've got the money. Or you can vote for what apparently the applause is in reflection, the lesser crowd here tonight, who suggest that something else is at stake. That's it."

Mayor Dennis noted that someone left keys at the microphone. Then he said that Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes will record for the record the letters which were received.

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes reported that 166 letters from 192 people were received in favor of the project and bond issuance for Faith West; 3 letters, representing 3 individuals were received opposed to the project and bond issuance; and one letter was received, whose attachment was, unfortunately, not one which could be opened.

Mayor Dennis extended his thanks to the West Lafayette School Corporation, and specifically School Superintendent Rocky Killion for allowing the City of West Lafayette to use this amazing, well-cooled facility, and to the AV staff and Jeff Stearns for their good work.

Mayor Dennis asked the Council for any further comment.

Councilor Hunt thanked everyone who responded. She said the Council got an awful lot of emails and she tried to respond to as many as she could. She thanked them for their input and said she appreciated the difficulty of speaking in front of a large group for many of you, particularly about such personal issues. She said this has been an extremely difficult position for her. She has strong support of our Human Relations Commission ordinances and was very proud of the work our Commission did to create these. She said that as a nurse, she is worried about certain scientific methods being used for counseling. She said she is pretty sure that what she's heard from her letters and tonight is that this is a ministry, and it's wonderful what they do, but it is a ministry. She said it should be noted that she voted in favor of the planned development but she is concerned about the fact that this is a ministry and that's what her vote will be based on.

Councilor Dietrich said if Councilor Hunt was able to respond to all the emails he was very impressed because he thought he was getting above the curve just to read each of them. Councilor Dietrich said he was originally reluctant to embrace this project because of a loss of potential income from property tax for the City. He said he challenged that in the early proceedings of the issue. To his knowledge it still has not been determined what part will be taxed, but the City does expect to be seeing some income in the form of property tax coming from this property. Councilor Dietrich said that Ms. Wallace did a far better job than he can do, but he did speak with Bob Wallenberg who wanted him to reiterate his extreme support of Faith West, on behalf of the American Red Cross local chapter. Councilor Dietrich said he felt that what Faith West is offering in terms of the Red Cross is a very significant factor. He said he can remember not having a place to replace the students who were left homeless because of a fire. He said there was potentially only one reason he was going to vote for the project. He said it can potentially be perceived as

a win-loss project, and there can be win-loss situations, but he said he feels the City stands to win here with what Faith West can bring to us. He said he is a firm believer that past history predicts future behavior. He said he thinks if we look at what Faith has given to the Lafayette community on the east side, West Lafayette can expect to reap a lot of benefits from it. Councilor Dietrich said it won't all be in dollars and cents but he thinks it will be in intangibles that will lead to dollars and cents for our City and he thinks that is reason, itself, for him to vote for the bond issue.

Councilor Burch thanked everyone who has emailed, written or called and said like Councilor Hunt she is trying to respond to everyone. She said she appreciated everyone's input and valued it.

Councilor Thomas said he appreciated Bill Baitinger's comment earlier that we have a venue where we can come and discuss issues and said we're all not going to agree on the issues, but will sometimes walk away and disagree, but it's a democracy and we have that right to express our feelings, and it's part of the system. He said that Vidhya Iyer read the statement from the Human Relations Commission on the issue and he appreciated that very much. Councilor Thomas asked Mayor Dennis to confirm an earlier statement he made that he had met with Faith Church and confirmed their commitment to remain in accordance with the Human Relations ordinance on sexual orientation, etc, etc.

Mayor Dennis confirmed that was true.

Councilor Thomas told Pastor Viars that Councilor Thomas' wife serves on the Human Relations Commission and said that in the last two weeks she has heard a lot about what the church's role is going to be in this project. Councilor Thomas said he believed that Pastor Viars is a man of his word and he believed that the church is going to be a good partner for West Lafayette, and said he was voting for this resolution, this ordinance. He said he has to believe that Faith Church is going to be a good partner and he would hold them to that. Councilor Burch said his wife would probably put him on the street if they didn't, and if that happens he would be calling them for a room.

Mayor Dennis added, "And he is a real big guy."

Councilor Thomas continued that he believes this project brings more positives than negatives to the table, and he believes it brings more economic development opportunities than what has been presented tonight in this venue.

Councilor Keen said that he, too, has received a lot of correspondence in relation to this ordinance and has not changed his mind at all. He said he does not see this as a separation of church and state as has been purported here tonight. He sees it more as a partnership with an organization within our community for economic development purposes. Councilor Keen said the Council has afforded the same type of issue to other organizations within our community and he doesn't see it as wrong to do the same for this organization, and he believes we almost have an obligation to support the economic development that this organization will bring to the community. He said the City has no risk and no investment in this proposal and that needs to be understood by everyone. Councilor Keen said the opportunity that the City is allowing for Faith West is for economic development purposes and he believes they will be an excellent partner, much like they have been in the Lafayette area. He said, much like the Red Cross who happen to see this organization as being a good community partner, his hope and his belief is that they

will be a good community partner, and will bring good things to the City of West Lafayette for many years to come. Councilor Keen said he agrees with Councilor Thomas that the pros of this far outweigh the cons. He thanked everyone for coming tonight and hearing what had to be said.

Councilor VanBogaert said, "Since everyone else has spoken – "

Mayor Dennis responded, "I was kind of waiting for that Eddie."

Councilor VanBogaert continued, "I will –"

Mr. Ethan Weg stood up in the back section of the auditorium and started inaudibly addressing the Council.

Mayor Dennis said he could not hear.

Councilor VanBogaert said, "He is going to ask if people actually address the people sitting out there."

Mr. Weg continued speaking inaudibly.

Mayor Dennis said Mr. Weg was out of order and that the Council would go ahead with the legislative process. Mayor Dennis said he would be more than happy to be available afterwards for Mr. Weg.

Councilor VanBogaert continued that he had supported Ordinance No. 09-12, and he thinks the benefits have been discussed here extensively, which was the Faith West planned development, because consistent with his voting philosophy, Faith West presented a structurally safe and attractive complex that rehabilitates a blighted space on Northwestern Avenue, and he stands by the vote. He said he appreciates the fact that representatives from Faith Church made a concerted effort to design a facility largely supported by the residents of the adjacent neighborhood. Councilor VanBogaert said the issuance of economic development revenue bonds is a separate matter. Councilor VanBogaert said that Faith Church has requested that the City make the bonds available so they may enjoy a lower interest rate on a portion of the building's financing. He said he did not fault Pastor Viars or the church for attempting to achieve cost savings on their project, that's good business. Councilor VanBogaert said he suspects the building would be constructed with or without the indirect subsidy and that is the question he has struggled with the most. He said he asserts the Council has the authority to issue these bonds and he acknowledged that the revenue and the credit of the City are not impacted by the decision. Councilor VanBogaert said there is some overlap of jurisdiction with federal policies and the City does have some fiduciary responsibility to the public units that serves our constituents, as they do to us. He said the Council must carefully evaluate whether they are acting sustainably when employing policy tools that have broader financial consequences, even though they are outside of the City's ledger. Councilor VanBogaert said some colleagues have suggested to him that the City issue these bonds as a show of good faith to our new neighbors, and while it is an admirable sentiment he tends to feel it doesn't sufficiently justify positive action in this case. He said, in his opinion, tax incentives should be deployed in order to make things happen that otherwise would not occur, and he would almost like to have more discussion on that because EDRB are not an entitlement, but part of a diverse tool kit for promoting growth, that

doesn't stand independently. Councilor VanBogaert said that utilizing this mechanism simply to deliver cost savings on a project, one for which he suspects financing is available, may not be an appropriate use of our authority. He said this has been the most difficult decision in his time on the Council and that judging by his colleagues comments he suspects the ordinance will be adopted and this will be created, so his concerns are almost a moot point, being that he is outside of the initial four that are needed. Councilor VanBogaert said he said he hoped that the neighbor who spoke very eloquently in support of the project, he agreed it would be a bridge, and he hoped that it is a bridge that is taken seriously. He said people have a tendency to review national issues in the newspaper and other venues and you don't get to see the people, for the most part, to whom you are referring. Councilor VanBogaert said that has the effect of not humanizing opponents, and that local government is very different. He said after this is over, and the vote has been taken, we will continue to be neighbors, see each other at the grocery store, and he urged everyone, even those in opposition, to embrace Faith into the community.

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes called the roll call vote:

	AYE	NAY	ABSENT	ABSTAIN
Bunder		✓		
Burch	✓			
Dietrich	✓			
Hunt		✓		
Keen	✓			
Thomas	✓			
VanBogaert		✓		

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes stated that the vote was 4 AYES and 3 NAYS.

Mayor Dennis announced that Ordinance No. 11-12 passed on second and final reading.

There was no further discussion.

Mayor Dennis asked to take a ten minute break due to the length of the meeting and asked the Police and Firemen to assist in the parking lot with exiting audience members.

The Council Meeting was recessed and reconvened ten minutes later.

Ordinance No. 12-12 An Ordinance To Establish The Cumulative Capital Development Fund And Readopt West Lafayette City Code Provisions Concerning the Fund (Submitted by the Clerk-Treasurer) PUBLIC HEARING

Mayor Dennis read Ordinance No. 12-12 by title.

Councilor Keen moved that Ordinance No. 12-12 be passed on first reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor Burch.

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes explained that tonight will be a public hearing and a vote on second reading to re-establish the Cumulative Capital Development Fund rate. This rate is critical to fund infrastructure throughout the City. The rate was initially established and readopted numerous times following changes in assessment to maintain the \$0.05 per

\$100 of assessed valuation. Following the implementation of annual trending the rate was not readopted and there was some concern about what the practice would be with the Department of Local Government. Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes reported she had just returned from an Indianapolis workshop for governmental financial officers, and had once more heard from the leadership the importance of re-establishing a Cumulative Capital Fund rate on an annual basis, so that it functions in the way that it was intended to. Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes asked for the Council's support on readopting the \$0.05 per \$100 of assessed valuation.

Councilor Bunder asked again if this will feel like a tax raise to people. Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes responded that it would, however there may be an adjustment at the State level. She noted that this would be something included in the 2013 budget.

There was no further discussion.

Councilor Keen moved that a public hearing be opened. Councilor Burch seconded the motion.

Mayor Dennis announced that a public hearing was in session.

Warren Eckles, 2550 Yeager Road, asked if this was the Council giving itself permission to raise taxes from \$0.0216 per \$100 to \$0.05 per \$100 or if this is the actual raise of the tax rate.

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes said this is the opportunity to receive public comment. Then, there will be a vote. Next, the proceedings are submitted to the Department of Local Government Finance. Then there will be an additional period to allow for public comment before the City would be allowed to include this in the plans for the 2013 Budget. After that, it would have to be adopted on all the public hearing votes for the budget in late summer and early fall.

There was no further discussion.

Councilor Keen moved to close the public hearing. Councilor Burch seconded the motion.

Mayor Dennis read Ordinance No. 12-12 by title.

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes called the roll call vote:

	AYE	NAY	ABSENT	ABSTAIN
Bunder	✓			
Burch	✓			
Dietrich	✓			
Hunt	✓			
Keen	✓			
Thomas	✓			
VanBogaert	✓			

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes stated that the vote was 7 AYES and 0 NAYS.

Mayor Dennis announced that Ordinance No. 12-12 passed on second and final reading.

NEW BUSINESS

Ordinance No. 13-12 An Ordinance Requesting An Additional Appropriation For The General Fund And The Fire Pension Fund (Prepared by the Clerk-Treasurer)

Mayor Dennis read Ordinance No. 13-12 by title.

Councilor Keen moved that Ordinance No. 13-12 be passed on first reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor Burch.

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes said she prepared the additional appropriation to address several situations that have arisen and were not foreseen in the adoption of the 2012 Budget. In the General Fund there have been increases in personnel expense related to changes in salaries in the Mayor's Office and separation of employment in the Clerk-Treasurer's Office and the Engineering Office, as well as the Fire Department. Other personnel costs that have arisen in the General Fund relating to our final census in enrollment, in other words, which insurance choices our employees made, and we would need additional appropriations to meet our obligations as we estimate them through the end of the year. Another component of personnel expense is due to funding for the wellness incentives and that's also related to the insurance enrollment because we would have sufficient funds for the insurance premiums and also fund the wellness program. The General Fund additional appropriation has a separate component, not personnel, which would be for the Sanitation Department, under Other Equipment, \$252,000 for purchase of recycling totes to be provided to citizens. The total additional appropriation is \$473,560. The appropriation in the Fire Pension Fund is for \$120,020 which relates to the eligibility of a member of the old Fire Pension Fund to participate in the lump sum distribution. This is a form of pension benefit available for convertees, up to June 30<sup>th</sup>, which provides a payout up front, at the beginning of their retirement, and a reduced monthly pension benefit subsequently that would be paid out of the Fire Pension Fund. The total additional appropriation requested is \$592,580. Last Council meeting there was some discussion about the financial position, particularly of the General Fund. Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes said that at the request of Councilman Bunder, following revisions on the City's circuit breaker estimates, she did additional follow up with the County Assessor and County Auditor. She said it had become more unclear. There were a number of corrections to parcels that resulted in reclassification and ultimately the placement of properties under lower circuit breaker caps. That significantly raised the West Lafayette circuit breaker impact to 50% higher than it was last year, and about that much higher than was originally calculated from the abstract billing in early April. Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes said it appears there may be some other factors that may have occurred that are under research in the County Auditor's Office. The County Auditor has been on leave for medical reasons, so it has taken longer for them to give us more detail on what occurred with the West Lafayette assessment that resulted in the huge change. Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes said she wanted to emphasize that as far as we understand the change was from the result of the classification of parcels. Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes noted the City also had available the Department of Local Government Finance in getting to the bottom of what changes occurred.

Councilor Bunder asked where the money will come from. Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes responded it would come from the unappropriated balance of the reserve. She noted we

COMMON COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES, June 4, 2012, CONTINUED

would maintain a balance of about 22% in the General Fund after the money was moved. If the Rainy Day Funds are taken into consideration, there is approximately 28% in reserves. This places the City well above the minimum of 15%, and certainly above a very strong 20% reserve which Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes would advise.

There was no further discussion.

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes called the roll call vote:

	AYE	NAY	ABSENT	ABSTAIN
Bunder	✓			
Burch	✓			
Dietrich	✓			
Hunt	✓			
Keen	✓			
Thomas	✓			
VanBogaert	✓			

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes stated that the vote was 7 AYES and 0 NAYS.

Mayor Dennis announced that Ordinance No. 13-12 passed on first reading.

Resolution No. 09-12 A Resolution Appropriating Insurance Recovery Received For Damage To City Property (Prepared by the Clerk-Treasurer)

Mayor Dennis read Resolution No. 09-12 by title.

Councilor Keen moved that Resolution No. 09-12 be passed on first and only reading, and that the vote be by roll call. The motion was seconded by Councilor Burch.

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes said that this was to appropriate recoveries for damage to police vehicles. The purpose of bringing the rather large numbers of insurance recoveries to the attention of the Council, was to allow for the knowledge that these appropriations will not be annual and adjust the 2013 budget accordingly.

There was no further discussion.

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes called the roll call vote:

	AYE	NAY	ABSENT	ABSTAIN
Bunder	✓			
Burch	✓			
Dietrich	✓			
Hunt	✓			
Keen	✓			
Thomas	✓			
VanBogaert	✓			

Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes stated that the vote was 7 AYES and 0 NAYS.

Mayor Dennis announced that Resolution No. 09-12 passed on first and only reading.

COMMUNICATIONS

► Councilor VanBogaert thanked the police officers and fire officers for their presence and help in the evening's proceedings. Councilor Hunt agreed.

CITIZENS COMMENTS

► Thomas Kessler (479 Maple Street) reminded everyone of recurrent problems with trash in the alleys of New Chauncey Neighborhood. He also commented that his ability to pay any new taxes will plummet on July 1, 2012 when he retires.

Councilor Bunder and Mayor Dennis congratulate Mr. Kessler on his retirement.

Mayor Dennis thanked Street Commissioner Downey for moving the chairs from City Hall for the meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business at this time, Councilor Keen moved for adjournment, and Mayor Dennis adjourned the meeting, the time being 9:25 p.m.