



April 4, 2012

Board of Public Works and Safety  
City of West Lafayette  
609 West Navajo Street  
West Lafayette, IN 47906

Re: Aeration Tank Addition  
Evaluation of Bids

Dear Board Members:

Pursuant to the advertisement, Bids for the Aeration Tank Addition were received at 8:30 a.m. on February 14, 2012 at City Hall, 609 West Navajo Street, West Lafayette, Indiana. Each of the sealed bids was opened and read aloud at the meeting of the Board of Public Works and Safety.

Nine (9) bids were received. A copy of the official Bid Tabulation is enclosed. The contractors which submitted bids and their respective bid amounts are as follows:

<u>Contractor</u>	<u>Bid Price</u>
Thieneman Construction, Inc.	\$1,257,000.00
R.L. Turner Corp.	\$1,395,000.00
Graves Plumbing	\$1,454,545.00
Walsh Construction Company II	\$1,492,900.00
Reynolds, Inc.	\$1,549,000.00
M.K. Betts Engineering & Contracting	\$1,558,500.00
F.A. Wilhelm Construction Co.	\$1,583,000.00
Hagerman, Inc.	\$1,584,000.00
Mid-States General Mechanical Contracting Corp.	\$1,630,000.00

The engineer's opinion of probable construction cost for the project was \$1,300,000. One bid was below the engineer's opinion while eight were above. The low bid was approximately 3% below the engineer's opinion, while the second low bid was approximately 7% above.

We have reviewed the bid package for the apparent low bidder, Thieneman Construction, Inc. (TCI), and the bid documents appear to be complete. Based on Wessler's experience with TCI on recent projects, they have not been responsible in meeting their contractual obligations based on the following:

- Digester Glycol Piping Improvements, Muncie Sanitary District, 2011 - TCI achieved Substantial Completion in 200 days, 68 days beyond the 132 day Contractual Time (52% overrun).

- WWTP Improvements, City of Frankfort, 2010-present - TCI has exceeded the Contractual Substantial Completion date of February 28, 2012 and, per their current construction schedule, plans to reach Substantial Completion for the original Contractual Work in June 2012, approximately four months late. They also failed to meet three major milestone completion dates during the project:
  - One milestone date set as March 18, 2011 to meet a completion date imposed by IDEM was reached in June 2011, approximately 3 months beyond the contractual milestone date.
  - Two milestones were to be completed during the summer of 2011 and are not yet complete:
    - One milestone involves sequential improvements to two digester tanks to be completed within a 5-month span of May-September 2011. The first tank was not taken out of service (per TCI's request) until August 10, 2011 and has been out of service to-date (8+ months), with work on the second tank yet to commence.
    - Work on the equalization basins was to be coordinated with the Owner's annual summer cleaning of the basins and completed by the end of August 2011. This work is still on-going, and the Owner was unable to clean the basins during the summer of 2011 due to TCI not having materials on-site and ready to perform the work during the time period specified.
  - TCI acted in a non-responsible and deliberate manner when they ran short installing the specified wastewater filter media and installed a totally different and unacceptable type of drinking water filter media brought in from a different project without requesting approval from or notifying the Engineer of their intent. Their actions were observed by the Wessler on-site construction representative and they were required to remove the unacceptable filter media and replace it with the specified filter media.
  - TCI has had six different Superintendents during this project, none of which were dedicated on-site full-time (contrary to the Contract requirements), and three different project managers.

We also contacted other references listed in the TCI Bid for recent or current projects and received the following feedback:

- CSO Pump Station, City of Goshen, 2011-2012 – The project manager for the engineering consultant reported difficulty with TCI and a lack of meeting Contract Times. TCI changed Superintendents several times which caused delays and a loss of continuity. On several occasions materials and equipment were not on-site when they intended to begin Work, resulting in delays. During a period of 3-4 months this past winter very little Work was completed, even though Substantial Completion had not yet been achieved. This project was constructed concurrent with the CSO Basin project (by a different contractor), required the lesser amount of time to complete, and needed to be completed prior to the CSO Basin project. Even though the CSO Basin project was delayed, the CSO Pump Station constructed by TCI was not completed prior to the CSO Basin

project. The contractual dates for Substantial and Final Completion were exceeded by 4 months, although a final change order is currently outstanding that will increase the Contract Time accordingly. A recent change in personnel has resulted in improved performance.

- Digester Gas Handling Improvements, City of Fort Wayne, 2011 – The project manager for the City reported some difficulties with TCI and a lack of meeting Contractual Times. Issues with the first TCI crew included improper welding of gas piping and safety issues. Most of the digester gas piping joints were not properly welded and failed the initial pressure tests. TCI replaced the first crew with another crew to repair the unacceptable Work and complete the project. Proper safety procedures were critical on this project due to working around live gas piping. Proper safety was initially lacking, but was resolved after TCI brought in safety personnel to address the issues. The project finished 4 months late, but liquidated damages were not imposed. Shop drawings were not submitted in a timely manner at the beginning of the project. Overall the project was completed, and TCI has not been disallowed from bidding on future projects.

We have reviewed the bid package for the second low bidder, R.L. Turner Corporation, and the bid documents appear to be complete. Based on the evaluation of their experience and qualifications it appears they should be capable and qualified to perform the Work required by the Contract Documents.

Pursuant to the Contract Documents, the Board may reject any and all bids, or accept any bid as may be deemed the lowest responsive and responsible bidder. Should the Board choose to award the Project based upon the bids received, Wessler recommends Notice of Award be made to R.L. Turner Corporation in the amount of \$1,395,000.00. We will prepare a Notice of Award to the selected Bidder for Board review and approval.

If you have any questions or comments please feel free to contact me at (317) 788-4551.

Sincerely,  
WESSLER ENGINEERING



Gary L. Ruston, P.E.  
Senior Project Manager

Enclosure

cc: Wessler file: 141511.05.01  
Judy Rhodes, Clerk-Treasurer  
Dave Buck, Public Works Director  
Dave Henderson, Utility Director

GLR:Y:\Project Files - active\141511 W Lafayette Aeration Tank\05-001 Bid\E Bids-Bid Tab-Evaluation\2012-03-28L Bid Evaluation DRAFT.doc

# BID TABULATION

PROJECT NO. 141511.05.01		Engineer's Estimate \$1,300,000										SHEET NO. 1 of 2
PROJECT TITLE Aeration Tank Addition												
Wastewater Treatment Utility												
West Lafayette, IN												
DATE	2/14/12	TIME	8:30 AM	FORM	BID	BID	BID	BID	FINANCIAL	ADDENDA	LUMP SUM	REMARKS
BIDDER												
Thieneman Construction Inc.		X		X	X	X	X	X	X	1, 2, 3	\$1,257,000.00	
R.L. Turner Corporation		X		X	X	X	X	X	X	1, 2, 3	\$1,395,000.00	Form 96 Section II, attached Exhibit A not included - submitted 2/29/2012
Graves Plumbing Company, Inc.		X		X	X	X	X	X	X	1, 2, 3	\$1,454,545.00	Local Price Preference indicated
Walsh Construction Company II, LLC		X		X	X	X	X	X	X	1, 2, 3	\$1,492,900.00	
Reynolds, Inc.		X		X	X	X	X	X	X	1, 2, 3	\$1,549,000.00	2005 Form 96
M.K. Betts Engineering & Contracting, Inc.		X		X	X	X	X	X	X	1, 2, 3	\$1,558,500.00	
F.A. Wilhelm Construction Company, Inc.		X		X	X	X	X	X	X	1, 2, 3	\$1,583,000.00	
Hagerman, Inc.		X		X	X	X	X	X	X	1, 2, 3	\$1,584,000.00	
WESSLER ENGINEERING										INDIANAPOLIS, INDIANA		

